

Comment



Comment on Weber et al. Mayenite-Based Electride C12A7e⁻: A Reactivity and Stability Study. *Catalysts* 2021, *11*, 334

Yasunori Inoue¹, Masaaki Kitano² and Hideo Hosono^{2,*}

- ¹ Catalyst Section, R & D Department, Tsubame-BHB Co., Ltd., 4259 Nagatsuta, Midori-ku, Yokohama 226-8503, Japan; y.inoue@tsubame-bhb.co.jp
- ² Materials Research Center for Element Strategy, Tokyo Institute of Technology, 4259 Nagatsuta, Midori-ku, Yokohama 226-8503, Japan; kitano.m.aa@m.titech.ac.jp
- * Correspondence: hosono@mces.titech.ac.jp



Citation: Inoue, Y.; Kitano, M.; Hosono, H. Comment on Weber et al. Mayenite-Based Electride C12A7e⁻: A Reactivity and Stability Study. *Catalysts* 2021, *11*, 334. *Catalysts* 2021, *11*, 1154. https://doi.org/ 10.3390/catal11101154

Academic Editors: Alessandro Di Michele and Carlo Pirola

Received: 23 April 2021 Accepted: 14 September 2021 Published: 26 September 2021

Publisher's Note: MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



Copyright: © 2021 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/).

In 2012, we reported that C12A7 electride (C12A7: e⁻) significantly promotes the catalytic activity of Ru nanoparticles for ammonia synthesis through the electron donation from the C12A7: e⁻ with a low work function (2.4 eV) to Ru [1]. Recently, Weber et al. [2] reported in this journal that the application of Ru/C12A7e⁻ catalysts at the industrial scale is limited prospects due to irreversible hydride formation at high pressures >1 MPa. According to their study, the catalytic activity of Ru/C12A7: e⁻ disappeared immediately above 1 MPa, which is totally different from our previous result [1]. Figure 1 summarizes the relevant data in [1,2]. Such a large difference may be caused by the difference in electron concentration (N_e) of C12A7: e⁻ used. In [2], the plasma arc melting synthesized C12A7: e^- (aluminum solid reductant) samples are of dark green color and the is N_e is explained to be in the range of 0.1 to 1.2×10^{21} cm⁻³. As we reported in [3], the catalytic performance of Ru/C12A7: e^- critically depends on the electron concentration (N_e) of C12A7: e^- , e.g., Ru/C12A7: e⁻ with $N_e > 1.0 \times 10^{21}$ cm⁻³ exhibits an order of magnitude higher activity for ammonia synthesis than those with low N_e (<5.0 × 10²⁰ cm⁻³). We consider that the electron concentration of the plasma-synthesized C12A7: e⁻ sample is obviously lower than 1.0×10^{21} cm⁻³. Kammert et al. also prepared C12A7: e⁻ by a similar method using aluminum as a solid reductant, and Ne of the obtained C12A7: e⁻ was determined to be 4.0×10^{20} cm⁻³ by iodometric titration method [4]. Such an insufficient N_e is not effective for the promotion of Ru catalyst in ammonia synthesis. Green sample color means electron concentration does not reach 1×10^{21} cm⁻³ in our accumulated data. Quantitative relation between $N_{\rm e}$ and the peak position of absorption band due to electron trapped in the cages are already reported in [5]. We examined the application of the modified Ru/C12A7: e⁻ catalysts in ammonia synthesis at high pressures up to 5 MPa. As shown in Figure 1, the ammonia synthesis activity of the modified Ru/C12A7: e⁻ catalyst increases with reaction pressure above 3 MPa. Furthermore, the modified Ru/C12A7: e⁻ catalyst exhibited excellent stability for almost 2 years at high pressure condition (5 MPa). Therefore, we demonstrate that the Ru/C12A7: e⁻-based catalyst has great potential as a practical catalyst for ammonia synthesis.

Based on the above results, we disagree with the conclusions by Weber et al. that the application potential of C12A7 electride under industrially relevant conditions is limited. We would like to emphasize that the catalytic performance of Ru/C12A7: e^- changes drastically by electronic structure of C12A7: e^- controlled by N_e and Ru-support interface structure [6]. A comprehensive review on electrides and their applications focusing on catalyst for NH₃ synthesis was recently published [7]. We hope this review is helpful for understanding our concept and approach.



Figure 1. Relative activity of various Ru/C12A7: e^- catalysts as a function of reaction pressure. Temperature: ~360 °C.

Author Contributions: H.H. conceived the research, Y.I. and M.K. performed the experiment, and all the authors discussed and wrote the paper. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Funding: The research was supported in part by the MEXT Element Strategy Initiative to Form Core Research Center (No. JPMXP0112101001) and JSPS Kakenhi Grants-in-Aid (No. 17H06153).

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- Kitano, M.; Inoue, Y.; Yamazaki, Y.; Hayashi, F.; Kanbara, S.; Matsuishi, S.; Yokoyama, T.; Kim, S.-W.; Hara, M.; Hosono, H. Ammonia synthesis using a stable electride as an electron donor and reversible hydrogen store. *Nat. Chem.* 2012, *4*, 934–940. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Weber, S.; Schäfer, S.; Saccoccio, M.; Ortner, N.; Bertmer, M.; Seidel, K.; Berendts, S.; Lerch, M.; Gläser, R.; Kohlmann, H.; et al. Mayenite-Based Electride C12A7e⁻: A Reactivity and Stability Study. *Catalysts* 2021, 11, 334. [CrossRef]
- 3. Kanbara, S.; Kitano, M.; Inoue, Y.; Yokoyama, T.; Hara, M.; Hosono, H.J. Mechanism Switching of Ammonia Synthesis Over Ru-Loaded Electride Catalyst at Metal–Insulator Transition. *Am. Chem. Soc.* **2015**, *137*, 14517–14524. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Kammert, J.; Moon, J.; Cheng, Y.; Daemen, L.L.; Irle, S.; Fung, V.; Liu, J.; Page, K.; Ma, X.; Phaneuf, V.; et al. Nature of Reactive Hydrogen for Ammonia Synthesis over a Ru/C12A7 Electride Catalyst. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* 2020, 142, 7655–7667. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Matsuishi, S.; Nomura, T.; Hirano, M.; Kodama, K.; Shamoto, S.I.; Hosono, H. Drect Synthesis of Powdery Inorganic Electride [Ca₂₄Al₂₈O₆₄]⁴⁺(e⁻)₄ and Determination of Oxygen Stoichiometry. *Chem. Mater.* 2009, 21, 2589–2591. [CrossRef]
- Hosono, H. Electron Transfer from Support/Promotor to Metal Catalyst: Requirements for Effective Support. Catal. Lett. 2021. [CrossRef]
- Hosono, H.; Kitano, M. Advances in Materials and Applications of Inorganic Electrides. *Chem. Rev.* 2021, 121, 3121–3186. [CrossRef] [PubMed]