

Review

# Understanding Molecular Mechanisms of Seed Dormancy for Improved Germination in Traditional Leafy Vegetables: An Overview

# Fernand S. Sohindji, Dêêdi E. O. Sogbohossou<sup>®</sup>, Herbaud P. F. Zohoungbogbo, Carlos A. Houdegbe<sup>®</sup> and Enoch G. Achigan-Dako \*<sup>®</sup>

Laboratory of Genetics, Horticulture and Seed Science, Faculty of Agronomic Sciences, University of Abomey-Calavi, 01 BP 526 Tri Postal, Cotonou, Benin; sohindjisilverfer@gmail.com (F.S.S.); deedik@gmail.com (D.E.O.S.); phanuelherbaud@gmail.com (H.P.F.Z.); houdariscarl@gmail.com (C.A.H.)

\* Correspondence: enoch.achigandako@uac.bj; Tel.: +229-95-39-32-83

Received: 28 October 2019; Accepted: 24 December 2019; Published: 1 January 2020



**Abstract:** Loss of seed viability, poor and delayed germination, and inaccessibility to high-quality seeds are key bottlenecks limiting all-year-round production of African traditional leafy vegetables (TLVs). Poor quality seeds are the result of several factors including harvest time, storage, and conservation conditions, and seed dormancy. While other factors can be easily controlled, breaking seed dormancy requires thorough knowledge of the seed intrinsic nature and physiology. Here, we synthesized the scattered knowledge on seed dormancy constraints in TLVs, highlighted seed dormancy regulation factors, and developed a conceptual approach for molecular genetic analysis of seed dormancy in TLVs. Several hormones, proteins, changes in chromatin structures, ribosomes, and quantitative trait loci (QTL) are involved in seed dormancy regulation. However, the bulk of knowledge was based on cereals and *Arabidopsis* and there is little awareness about seed dormancy facts and mechanisms in TLVs. To successfully decipher seed dormancy in TLVs, we used *Gynandropsis gynandra* to illustrate possible research avenues and highlighted the potential of this species as a model plant for seed dormancy analysis. This will serve as a guideline to provide prospective producers with high-quality seeds.

**Keywords:** seed dormancy; seed germination; molecular biology; genetics; traditional leafy vegetables; *Gynandropsis gynandra* 

## 1. Introduction

More than 1000 species were recorded to be used by African rural communities for dietary diversity, medicine purpose, food traditions, and cultural identity [1–4]. Given the potential of African traditional leafy vegetables (TLVs) to cope with varying climate constraints and feed Africa, the production and consumption of the same have been promoted in the continent for the last two decades. For example, the antioxidant system of *Cleome spinosa* Jacq. and *Gynandropsis gynandra* L. (Briq) variously copes with reactive oxygen species (ROS) formation under drought conditions limiting damage to cell structures, lipids, proteins, carbohydrates, nucleic acids, and cell death [5]. Luoh et al. [6] reported also the lowest losses of nutrients in amaranth species and the African nightshade species when cultivating under deficient conditions. Few species such as *Amaranthus* spp., *Solanum scabrum* Mill., and *Solanum macrocarpon* L. have been well domesticated, whereas *Bidens pilosa* L., *Brassica carinata* A. Braun., *Gynandropsis gynandra*, *Corchorus* spp., *Launaea taraxacifolia* Willd., *Talinum triangulare* Willd., etc. are widely used over the continent, but still semi-domesticated species and can grow spontaneously and/or cultivated according to the sociolinguistic groups or regions [3]. The successful promotion of those



crops requires a proper investigation of all aspects related to their life cycle. The first step toward such promotion is to focus on farmers' traits of interest and constraints during cultivation and marketing. Once farmers' priorities are clearly defined, a subsequent step is to investigate crop physiology in relation to the traits of interest for farmers. For several species including *Gynandropsis gynandra*, *Solanum nigrum* L., *Amaranthus* spp., and *Corchorus* spp. the lack of high-quality seeds is the main constraint for full domestication [7]. In fact, seed germination and seed dormancy processes are still unclear for many traditional leafy vegetables. Farmers are confronted with the loss of seed viability, poor and delayed germination of seeds, and inaccessibility to quality seeds limiting all-year-round production of those crops [8,9]. In addition, Adebooye et al. [10] and Sogbohossou et al. [11] brought to light several gaps of knowledge for the improvement of TLVs. They listed, for instance: (1) the lack of extensive germplasm collections; (2) the need to understand the genetic control of key traits; (3) the need to develop and evaluate new cultivars, assess end-users' preferences, and perform multi-environment experiments; (4) the demand for appropriate technical packaging; and (5) the call for sustained efforts for value chain development. However, to reach active domestication, it is important to ensure quality seed availability and find solutions for seed dormancy issues that limit TLVs adoption and production.

Seed dormancy is a state of a viable seed, expressed by the inhibition of germination under favourable environmental conditions required for adequate germination [12,13]. It is an adaptive trait that optimizes the distribution of germination over time in a population of seeds [14]. On the other hand, germination is usually related to radicle protrusion, which is normally the visible result of germination [15]. Before this visible aspect, there are many events that begin with the uptake of water by mature dry seed and imbibition, and end with the embryonic axis elongation [16]. Seed dormancy and the absence of favourable environmental conditions for germination result in the absence of germination [12]. Non-germination due to unfavourable conditions is referred to as "quiescence" and enables seed survival for further seedling development under adverse conditions [17]. Seed dormancy appears as a complex quantitative trait under the influence of several genetic, hormonal, physiological, and environmental factors [18]. The pre-harvest sprouting and the absence or Delay of Germination after-ripening are the two undesirable contrasting levels of seed dormancy. Consequently, the constraint about dormancy is twofold: either it is not present in seeds (zero level) leading to pre-harvest sprouting especially for cereals or it is present at high level leading to the absence or Delay of Germination at the desired time [19,20]. There are two types of seed dormancy based on its times of expression: "primary dormancy" developed on the mother plant [21], and "secondary dormancy" induced in previously non-dormant seeds or re-induced in seeds that have lost primary dormancy due to the unfavourable environment factors for germination after seed dispersal [22]. Baskin and Baskin [12] reported various classes of dormancy based on embryo growth potential, seed coat, and seed physiological responses to temperature. Some of the classes were: physical dormancy (PY), physiological dormancy (PD), morphological dormancy (MD), morpho-physiological dormancy (MPD), and combinational dormancy (physical and physiological dormancy).

As stated by Koornneef et al. [23], the challenge is to master the initiation and suppression of germination ability through gene identification based on changes in seed transcriptome, proteome, and hormones under different environmental conditions. So far, the majority of molecular genetic studies on seed dormancy were conducted in the model plant species *Arabidopsis thaliana* L. [24] and economically important crops such as *Oryza sativa* L. [25], *Triticum aestivum* L. [26], and *Lycopersicum esculentum* Mill. [27]. Such studies revealed that seed germinability and subsequent seedling development are controlled by two sets of factors: internal factors including proteins, plant hormones (Abscissic–Gibberellic acids balance), chromatin-related factors (methylation, acetylation, histone ubiquitination), related genes (maturating genes and hormonal and epigenetics-regulating genes), non-enzymatic processes, seed morphological and structural components (endosperm, pericarp, seed coat), and external factors, such as light, temperature, salinity, acidity, soil nitrate [28,29]. These biotic and abiotic factors interact and determine the presence or absence of dormancy during seed development, in imbibed mature seeds and in dry seeds. Despite the fact that efforts of plant

biologists, crop geneticists, breeders, and food scientists to understand seed dormancy phenomenon have shed light on physiology, genetic and molecular aspects of seed dormancy, little is known about TLVs species, although seed dormancy is still a challenge in these species as above described.

In this paper, we provide a synthesis of the current state of knowledge about seed dormancy in TLVs and seed dormancy control in plants. We further discussed how to transfer such knowledge to leafy vegetables in tropical areas. We highlighted the case of spider plant (*Gynandropsis gynandra*), a traditional leafy vegetable closely related to the model species *A. thaliana*. This review addressed the following questions: what is the germination ability of the well consumed TLVs? How do we identify seed dormancy regulatory genes in TLVs? How do we study the effects of those genes on seed germination? What approach do we implement to develop new cultivars with higher seed quality and attributes?

## 2. Methods

Literature search was conducted in PubMed Central and Google Scholar databases. Well-studied crops such as *Arabidopsis thaliana*, *Oryza sativa*, *Zea mays* L., *Triticum aestivum*, *Hordeum vulgare* L., *Lycopersicum esculentum*, *Avena sativa* L., *Nicotiana plumbaginifolia* Viv., and African leafy vegetables such as *Gynandropsis gynandra*, *Solanum nigrum*, *Corchorus olitorius* L., *Talinum triangulare* (Jacq.) Willd., and *Amaranthus* spp. (Figure 1) were considered in the search. The keywords used to collect the documents included "seed dormancy", "molecular control", "hormonal control and genetic variation", "germination of African/indigenous/traditional leafy vegetables", and "seed constraints for African/indigenous/traditional leafy vegetables". No date coverage was specified during the search. The relevance of documents was assessed based on the molecular pathways, genetic control, and environmental factors reported about seed dormancy or seed germination. The process consisted of a preliminary screening of titles and abstracts of 243 papers. The reading of full texts helped select 194 relevant papers for further review.



**Figure 1.** Some of important African traditional leafy vegetables widely used across Africa: (a) *Gynandropsis gynandra*, (b) *Solanum nigrum*, (c) *Corchorus olitorius*, (d) *Talinum triangulare*, (e,f) *Amaranthus* spp. Pictures: courtesy of F.S. Sohindji, H.F.P. Zohoungbogbo and E.G. Achigan-Dako.

#### 3. Seed Dormancy in Traditional Leafy Vegetables

Seed dormancy prevents seeds to germinate under unfavourable conditions for further growth and development of the plant. In many leafy vegetables, it appears as a challenge while rapid and uniform germination are expected after sowing. So far, physical and physiological dormancy are the main dormancy cases reported in TLVs species from mature freshly harvested seeds to dry seeds [30]. An overview of studies on seed dormancy in TLVs is presented in Table 1.

| Common Name        | Scientific Name (Family)               | Seed Constraints  | References |
|--------------------|--|---|------------|
| Spider plant       | Gynandropsis gynandra<br>(Cleomaceae)  | Primary non-deep physiological dormancy<br>Physical dormancy and secondary dormancy<br>Oxygen barrier between embryo and tissue<br>Low germination of freshly harvested seeds<br>Delayed, poor, and absence of germination<br>Inaccessibility of quality seed for seed analysts and<br>gene bank curators<br>Low vigor and reduced number of viable seeds<br>harvested by farmers<br>Physiological dormancy | [31,32]    |
| Jute mallow        | Corchorus olitorius<br>(Malvaceae)     | Loss of viability and poor germination of fresh and old seeds Impermeable seed coat   | [8,33]     |
| African Nightshade | Solanum nigrum (Solanaceae)            | Poor germination of seeds<br>Improper seed extraction<br>Deeper level of primary dormancy   | [8,34]     |
| Waterleaf          | Talinum triangulare<br>(Portulacaceae) | Dormancy due to the nature of the seed testa<br>Undetermined physiological factors  | [35]       |
| Amaranths species  | Amaranthus spp.<br>(Amaranthaceae)     | Primary dormancy and secondary dormancy occur<br>among amaranths species  | [36]       |

Table 1. Seed constraints and dormancy types reported for traditional leafy vegetables.

Seeds of waterleaf (Talinum triangulare) are known to exhibit a kind of dormancy due to the impermeability of the seed testa and some undetermined physiological factors [35]. These authors reported that scarification, alternating temperatures (6–10 °C and 28–35 °C), and constant temperature (34 °C) should enhance germination of waterleaf seeds. Taab and Andersson [34] reported a deeper level of primary dormancy for nightshade (Solanum nigrum). Dormancy-breaking treatments with stratification, potassium nitrate, and gibberellic acid failed to show encouraging results, and are often not applicable at farmers' level [34,37]. A loss of viability and poor germination of fresh and old seeds in jute mallow (Corchorus olitorius) are associated with the impermeability of jute mallow seed coat [8,33]. In the case of spider plant (Gynandropsis gynandra), its cultivation is limited by the fact that its seeds can exhibit a high dormancy lasting for several months. Geneve [38] reported that a primary non-deep physiological dormancy occurs in spider plant while Ochuodho and Modi [39] suspected physical dormancy and secondary dormancy. Ekpong [40] clarified that spider plant seeds are permeable to water but this water is trapped in the tissue between the embryo and the seed coat creating an oxygen barrier. Baskin and Baskin [32] concluded that spider plant exhibits a physiological dormancy. Recently, Shilla et al. [31] reported that there were no dormancy cases on fresh seeds of spider plant according to World Vegetable Center preliminary results. Nevertheless, the seeds can stay in a dormant state for several months before germination is activated and improved with dry storage periods [41–43]. Various levels of seed dormancy such as primary and secondary dormancy occur among amaranths species. For instance, there are primary dormant Amaranthus retroflexus L., secondary dormant Amaranthus paniculatus L., and non-dormant Amaranthus caudatus L. seeds [36]. Seed treatments such as seed holding in low temperature, pre-chilling, and the application of ethylene induce dormancy-breaking and accelerate the germination process in *Amaranthus* seeds [44].

While other factors including harvest time, storage, and conservation conditions can be easily controlled by farmers, breaking seed dormancy requires a thorough knowledge of the seed intrinsic nature and physiology. Farmers' efforts to break seed dormancy are therefore still insufficient to assure

50% to 100% germination. Many seed pre-treatment techniques (Table 2) such as light/dark, cold/warm, tap/distilled water, and physical/chemical scarification have been tested by researchers to break the seed dormancy in crops [13]. Unfortunately, results obtained can be negatively affected by factors such as seed provenance, seasons of production, storage containers, storage period, and storage temperature, to list a few environmental conditions [43]. Therefore, traditional leafy vegetable seeds management is still traditional and farmers, seed companies, gene banks, and researchers require adequate methods for breaking seed dormancy of those species.

**Table 2.**Various strategies for seed dormancy-breaking in African leafy vegetables(Gynandropsis gynandra, Amaranthus spp., Corchorus olitorius, Talinum triangulare, Solanum nigrum).

| TLVs Species          | Strategies for Seed Dormancy-Breaking  |  |  |
|-----------------------|--|--|--|
| Gynandropsis gynandra | <ul> <li>Stratification for two weeks at 5 °C</li> <li>12 h of seed soaking</li> <li>Scarification with 1000 μM KNO<sub>3</sub>, 1000 μM K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>, 1000 (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub></li> <li>GA<sub>3</sub> application at a concentration of 500 ppm</li> <li>60 min of seed pre-washing in running water</li> <li>1–5 days of seed pre-heating at 40 °C</li> <li>Seed dried to 5% moisture content and stored at -20 °C</li> <li>3–6 months of after-ripening</li> <li>Seed puncturing at the radicle end</li> <li>Darkness and either alternating 20–30 °C or continuously at 30 °C for germination</li> <li>1 day of moist chilling at 5 °C</li> </ul> |  |  |
| Amaranthus species    | <ul> <li>Holding seeds for 18 months at 6 °C</li> <li>Pre-chilling treatment</li> <li>Scarification with 1000 μM KNO<sub>3</sub>, 1000 μM K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>, 1000 (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub></li> <li>100 μM GA<sub>3</sub> application</li> <li>Immersion in 2% KNO<sub>3</sub> solution for 24 h</li> <li>Cold seed stratification at 5 °C for 12 days</li> <li>Germination conditions under light</li> <li>Application of ethylene, ethephon or 1-aminocyclopropane-1-carboxylic acid</li> </ul>  |  |  |
| Corchorus olitorius   | <ul> <li>Mechanical scarification</li> <li>Leaching treatment</li> <li>Soaking in boiling water for 5 min</li> </ul>   |  |  |
| Talinum triangulare   | <ul> <li>Activated carbon</li> <li>Scarification</li> <li>5% thiourea treatment</li> <li>Constantly high temperature (34 °C) for germination</li> <li>Immersion in 0.2% potassium nitrate solution (24 h)</li> <li>Immersion in water (24 h)</li> </ul>  |  |  |
| Solanum nigrum        | <ul> <li>Soaking in GA3 with concentration of 0, 25, 50, 100, 200, and 400 ppm</li> <li>Wet and dry pre-chilling for 15, 30, and 45 days in 4 °C</li> <li>Seed coat chemical scarification for 1–3 min</li> <li>Exposing seed to UV-C radiation for 30 min</li> </ul>  |  |  |

### 4. Seed Dormancy Regulation in Plants

Seed dormancy is regulated by genotypic (internal regulation) and environmental factors during three stages in the persistent soil seed bank such as seed development, after-ripening, and seed germination. [45]. During seed development, some reserves are accumulated in seeds (reserve accumulation). During after-ripening, seeds especially orthodox seeds have ability to survive desiccation (desiccation tolerance). The seed germination stands for mobilization of reserves under favourable condition (reserve mobilization). The viable, mature, and freshly harvested seed can be dormant (primary dormancy) or non-dormant (able to germinate). The favourable conditions during after-ripening lead to the release of primary dormancy seed which becomes non-dormant. When conditions are unfavourable, non-dormant seeds, even those for which primary dormancy

was released, enter the quiescent state before entering into secondary dormancy when unfavourable conditions persist or could be able to germinate under favourable conditions.

The internal regulation of seed dormancy occurs in two main pathways acting in interaction with the environment. There is the hormone-level pathway (indirect pathway) and gene-level pathway (direct pathway). The different known regulators involved in seed dormancy control and their interactions are presented in Figure 2.



Figure 2. Mechanisms underlining seed dormancy and seed germination control in plants. This figure highlights abscisic and gibberellic acid metabolism and signalling pathways in plants and how ABA-GA balance is affected by the activity of other plant hormones and other genes enabling seed dormancy or seed germination. ABA1, abscisic acid deficient 1; ABA2, abscisic acid deficient 2; ZEP, zeaxanthin epoxidase; NCED, carotenoid cleavage dioxygenase; AAO3, abscisic aldehyde oxidase 3; ABA, abscisic acid; PYR/PYL/RCAR, pyrabactin resistance/pyrabactin-like/regulatory components of ABA receptors; ABI, abscisic acid insensitive; VP1, viviparous 1; bZIP, basic leucine zipper; CHO1, CHOTTO 1; SPT, SPATULA; FUS3, FUSCA3; LEC1, leafy cotyledon 1; WRKY41, WRKY DNA-binding protein 41; DEP, DESPIERTO; PP2C, protein phosphatase 2C; HON, HONSU; SnRK2, SNF1-related protein kinase 2; CYP707A, Cytochrome P450; ABA8'OH, ABA 8-hydroxylase; AP2, AP2-domain; MYB96, myeloblastosis 96; BRs, brassinosteroids; TaDET2, Triticum aestivum de-etiolated 2; Ta DWF4, Triticum aestivum DWF4; TaBSK2, Triticum aestivum brassinosteroid signaling kinase 2; BIN2, brassinosteroid insensitive 2; MFT, mother of FT and TFL1; ARF, auxin-responsive factors; AXR2, auxin resistant 2; AXR3, auxin resistant 3; ACO, 1-aminocyclopropane-1-carboxylic acid oxidase; ET, Ethylene; EIN2, ethylene insensitive 2; ETR1, ethylene triple response 1; ETR2, ethylene triple response 2; SNL1, SIN3-like 1; SNL2, SIN3-like 2; GGDP, geranylgeranyl pyrophosphate; CPS, ent-copalyl diphosphate synthetase; KO1, ENT-kaurene oxidase 1; GA3ox1, gibberellins 3-oxidase 1; GA20ox3, gibberellins 20-oxidase 3; GA2ox2, gibberellins 2-oxidase 2; GA2ox7, gibberellins 2-oxidase 7; AP2-39, AP2 domain-containing transcription factor OsAP2-39; EUI, elongated uppermost internode; DDF1, delayed flowering 1; GA, gibberellins; GATA, GATA proteins; ABC, ATP-binding cassette; DOF6, DNA binding1 zinc finger 6; DAG1, DOF affecting germination1; DAG2, DOF affecting germination2; DDF1, delayed flowering 1; DELLA, DELLA proteins; F-box, F-box proteins;

DOG1, Delay of Germination 1; *RGA*, repressor of gibberellin acid; *RGL1*, repressor of gibberellin acid like 1; *RGL2*, repressor of gibberellin acid like 2; *RDO2*, reduced dormancy 2; *CTS*, comatose; *PIL5*, phytochrome interacting factor 3-like 5; *TFIIS*, transcription factor S-II; *SLY1*, sleepy1; *GAI*, gibberellin acid insensitive; *GID1*, gibberellin acid insensitive dwarf1; *GID2*, gibberellin acid insensitive dwarf2; *EXPA2*, expansin-A2; *EXPA9*, expansin-A9; *XTH19*, xyloglucan endo-transglycosylase 19.

## 4.1. Direct Pathway Regulation

Delay of Germination (DOG) genes are important determinants of seed dormancy within populations. The seed dormancy QTL called Delay of Germination 1 (DOG1) was identified as responsible for a strong dormancy and acting in interaction with DOG3 [46]. DOG1 was shown to be specifically expressed during seed development with detectable levels in dry seeds [47]. Global transcript analysis in Arabidopsis using microarrays indicated that the expression level of DOG1 decreased during after-ripening [46]. The expression of DOG1 was also reduced in the hub1 mutant characterized by reduced dormancy in agreement with a role of DOG1 in regulating dormancy levels [48]. Bentsink et al. [49] identified eleven DOG QTLs but there is the absence of strong epistasis interaction between different DOG loci suggesting that DOG loci affect dormancy via distinct genetic pathways. However, not all DOG genomic regions identified by Bentsink et al. [49] contain genes that have previously been associated with seed dormancy. For instance, DOG3 collocates with LEC2, DOG4 with TT7 (Transparent Testa 7), DOG5 with ABI1, DOG19 with GA2, DOG20 with PIL5, and DOG22 with RGL2. DOG1 is involved in the enhancement of dormancy by low temperatures during seed maturation and is a central factor of seed dormancy [29,50–53]. Homologs of Arabidopsis DOG1 were characterized in other plants including *Brassica napus* L. [54,55], rice [54,56], *Lepidium sativum* L. [57], barley, and wheat [58]. Ashikawa et al. [58] reported that DOG1-like genes in wheat and barley were good candidate transgenes for reducing pre-harvest sprouting in wheat.

The DNA BINDING1 ZINC FINGER (DOF) proteins are a family of plant transcription factors in the plant kingdom and were identified as potential regulators of seed dormancy [59,60]. In *Arabidopsis* species, the genes encoding transcription regulators such as DOF affecting germination (*DAG*) have been identified and investigated for their efficiency in seed dormancy regulation [59,61]. Stamm et al. [62] reported 36 DOF proteins in *Arabidopsis*, many of which have been implicated in the regulation of germination. To support this, the DOF zinc finger proteins (DOF Affecting Germination 1 and 2) have been shown to possess opposing roles in the regulation of germination. For instance, *DAG1* inhibits germination by mediating *PIL5* activity and affecting gibberellin biosynthesis [63,64]. *DOF6* was shown to negatively regulate germination by affecting abscisic acid signalling in seeds [60]. Recently, Ravindran et al. [61] reported a novel crosstalk between DOF6 and *RGL2* that enables primary dormancy in *Arabidopsis* through GATA transcription factor regulation. This novel *RGL2*–DOF6 complex is required for activating *GATA12*, a gene encoding a GATA-type zinc finger transcription factor, as one of the downstream targets of *RGL2* expression in *Arabidopsis thaliana*, thus revealing a molecular mechanism to enforce primary seed dormancy by repressing GA signalling [59,61,62].

Other important genes are those related to reduced dormancy (*RDO*). A mutagenesis screen for seed dormancy in *Arabidopsis* yielded reduced dormancy (*RDO*) mutants, which appeared to be central for the dormancy mechanisms and an important target for seed dormancy research [65,66]. For example, *RDO2*, one of the genes identified from the screening, encoded *TFIIS* [67] and a mutation in *TFIIS* resulted in reduced seed dormancy [68]. Mutants *dog1* and *rdo4* presented a reduced seed longevity phenotype [55,69,70]. Then, the reduced dormancy mutants *rdo1* and *rdo2* are not affected in their response to ABA.

#### 4.2. Hormonal Pathway Regulation

Abscisic acid (ABA) produced by embryo is fundamental for the promotion of seed dormancy unlike that produced by maternal tissues through ABA biosynthesis genes such as carotenoid cleavage dioxygenase (*NCED*), ABA-deficient (*ABA1*, *ABA2*), and abscisic aldehyde oxidase 3 (*AAO3*) [71–74]. In *Arabidopsis thaliana*, the induction of seed dormancy is due to *NCED5*, *NCED6*, and *NCED9* genes

while *NCED1* and *NCED2* genes are reported regulating seed dormancy in cereals crops [17,75]. ABA is catabolized through ABA8'hydroxylase encoded by Cytochrome P450 (*CYP707A*) genes including *CYP707A1*, *CYP707A2* and *CYP707A3* [17]. ABA is signalled in *Arabidopsis* and monocot plants through ABA insensitive genes, such as *ABI1*, *ABI2*, *ABI3/VP1*, *ABI4*, *ABI5*, and *ABI8*. *ABI3/VP1* genes seem to be the most important in seed dormancy induction whereas *ABI4* regulates abiotic stress responses and different aspects of plant development and plays an important role in seed dormancy maintenance by binding itself to the promoter of *CYP707A1* and *CYP707A2* genes and repressing their expression [76]. Therefore, *NCED2* and *NCED3* activation is enhanced through *CHO1* encoding with APETELA 2 (*AP2*) domain, the ABA-responsive R3R2-type MYB transcription factor: myeloblastosis 96 (MYB96) [17,77]. These ABA signalling genes regulate seed dormancy through several transcription factors including Pyrabactin resistance proteins/PYR-like proteins/regulatory components of ABA receptor (PYR/PYL/RCAR), phosphatase 2C (PP2C), HONSU (HON), SNF1-related protein kinase 2 (SnRK2), and abscisic acid-responsive elements—binding factor (AREB) and basic leucine zipper (bZIP) [17,77–79].

Kucera et al. [80] identified an early and late GA biosynthesis within the embryo encoded respectively by ent-copalyl diphosphate synthetase (CPS1) gene and GA3ox2 gene in the cortex and endodermis of the root. Over-expression of GA biosynthesis genes such as gibberellins 3-oxidase 1 (GA3ox1), gibberellins 20-oxidase 3 (GA20ox3), and ENT-kaurene oxidase 1 (KO1) results in seed germination [17,81,82]. The regulation of GA signalling gene comatose (CTS) is a key component to have dormancy or germination. Its activation results in germination through a peroxisomal protein of the ATP-binding cassette (ABC) transporter class [17,83]. DELLA proteins act as repressors of GA signalling and integrate environmental cues into GA signalling through the expression of the repressor of GA (RGA), RGA-like 1 (RGL1), RGA-like 2 (RGL2), gibberellic acid insensitive (GAI), and GA INSENSITIVE DWARF (GID1, GID2) genes [17,84]. The F-box protein is a receptor that mediates GA responses for the degradation of DELLA-type transcription repressors [80] through the activation of sleepy1 (SLY1) gene [17,85]. Contrarily, Delay of Germination 1 (DOG1) regulates the expression of GA biosynthesis genes by the inhibition of genes encoding cell wall remodelling enzymes and by regulating the appropriate time of germination according to ambient temperature [86]. Another GA catabolism genes include elongated uppermost internode (EUI) and delayed flowering 1 (DDF1). ABI4 recruits an additional seed-specific transcription factor to repress the transcription of GA biogenesis gene or can directly bind itself to the promoter of GA2ox3 as ABI5, activating its expression [76,87].

It is reported that auxin may suppress seed germination under high salinity [88], delay seed germination, and inhibit pre-harvest sprouting through indole-3-acetic acid: IAA [89]. Auxin synthesis decreases during after-ripening treatment enabling seed dormancy break [90] and helps ABA in dormancy induction and protection [91] by repressing, for example, the embryonic axis elongation during seed germination [92].

Ethylene (ET) participates in the seed dormancy regulation through its receptors such as ethylene triple response (*ETR1*, *ETR2*) and ethylene insensitive 2 (*EIN2*). ET may repress ABA accumulation and promote seeds dormancy release so that the high ET content in seeds is associated with dormancy loss through SIN3-like 1 (*SNL1*) and *SNL2* genes at the epigenetic level [17,77,93–95]. At the same time, *SNL1* and *SNL2* promote seed dormancy through another pathway [96].

Brassinosteroid (BR) action consists in suppressing the inhibitory effect of ABA during the germination process in wild types of *Arabidopsis* through an MFT (Mother of Flowering locus T (FT) and Terminal flower 1 (TFL1))-mediated pathway [97]. The lower content of BR during germination, due to *BIN2* (Brassinosteroid Insensitive 2) gene activation, stabilizes ABI5 protein to mediate ABA signaling unless there is BR treatment to repress the *BIN2–ABI5* interaction [17,98]. BR biosynthesis genes (TaDE-etiolated 2 (*TaDET2*) and *TaDWARF* 4) and BR signalling promotion genes (TaBR signalling kinase 2 (*TaBSK2*)) have been identified in wheat [17,99].

Jasmonic acid (JA) can inhibit the germination process promoting the effect of ABA biosynthesis genes regulatory action on *MFT* gene by 12-oxo-phytodienoic acid (OPDA) in dry seeds whereas during

imbibition the transcription of those genes is repressed by JA [17,77,100–102]. Salicylic acid (SA) in a first way inhibits the expression of GA-induced a-amylase genes under normal growth conditions [77,103]. In the other way, it reduces oxidative damage under high salinity [77,104]. Cytokinin (CTKs) might effectively concentrate and direct cell division and elongation of the emerged root. In sorghum, cytokinin/ABA interaction controls germination by inducing ABI5 protein degradation [80,105]. Strigolactones (SLs) are involved in seed germination in *Arabidopsis*, in parasitic weeds, and in other species [77,106]. ABA is involved in SLs biosynthesis regulation in tomatoes [107]. Furthermore, some key components in the SL signalling pathway affect seed germination, including *SMAX1* (Suppressor of More Axillary Growth2 1) in *Arabidopsis* and its homolog *OsD53* in rice [77,108].

Numerous studies of the natural variation and various mutants have offered an opportunity to identify new seed dormancy regulators, their related genes or QTLs, and how they work. The description of seed dormancy regulators used in this review are presented in Tables 3 and 4.

| Mutants               | <b>Description/Action</b>  | References      |  |
|-----------------------|--|-----------------|--|
| nced6/nced9 and nced5 | Promote germination  | [75,109,110]    |  |
| aao3, aba1, and aba2  | Reduce dormancy  | [73,111]        |  |
| сур707а               | Enhance seed dormancy level  | [17,77,112,113] |  |
| abi1                  | Reduce dormancy through chilling and dry storage, reduce<br>ABA sensitivity for germination and no precocious<br>germination | [80,114]        |  |
| abi3                  | Leads to seed dormancy even in immature seeds  | [115–118]       |  |
| cts                   | Leads to the seed dormancy protection even after stratification and after-ripening   | [80]            |  |
| yuc1/yuc6 (Auxin)     | Reduce seed dormancy   | [89]            |  |
| ein2 (Ethylene)       | Leads to higher expression of NCED3  | [17.119.120]    |  |
| etr1                  | Induces lower activation of CYP707A2 genes   | []              |  |
| snl1 and snl2         | Reduce seed dormancy together with the increased Ethylene content  | [96]            |  |
| hub1(rdo4)            | Characterized by a reduced dormancy  | [48]            |  |
| tfiis                 | Reduces seed dormancy  | [68]            |  |
| dog1 and rdo4         | <i>dog1</i> and <i>rdo4</i> Reduce seed longevity phenotype  |                 |  |
| rdo1 and rdo2         | Not affected in their response to ABA  | _ [00/07/7 0]   |  |

**Table 3.** Description of mutant genes controlling seed dormancy reported by previous studies in

 *Arabidopsis thaliana*.

Note: yuc1/yuc6, mutants of Yucca flavin monooxygenase genes; hub1, mutant of Homologous to UBIquitin; nced, mutant of NCED; aao3, AAO3 mutant; aba1/aba2, ABA1/ABA2 mutant; CYP707a, CYP707A mutant; abi1/abi3, ABI1/ABI3 mutant; cts, CTS mutant; ein2, EIN2 mutant; snl1/snl2, SNL1/SNL2 mutant; tfiis, TFIIS mutant, dog1, DOG1 mutant; rdo1/rdo2/rdo4, RDO1/RDO2/RDO4 mutant; etr1, ETR1 mutant.

| Process                                   | Genes                           | Description   | <b>Related Species</b>   | References          |
|---|---------------------------------|---|--|---------------------|
|   | NCED5, NCED6, NCED9             | Induction of seed dormancy  | Arabidopsis thaliana   | [17,75,109,121,122] |
| ABA biosynthesis                          | NCED1, NCED2                    | Induction of seed dormancy  | Oryza sativa, Hordeum vulgare  | [17]                |
| ABA1, ABA2Encode for zeaxanthine poxidase |                                 | Arabidopsis thaliana; Zea mays;<br>Nicotiana plumbaginifolia  | [80]   |                     |
|   | AAO3                            | Encodes final step of ABA biosynthesis  | Arabidopsis thaliana   | [80,123]            |
| ABA catabolism                            | СҮР707А1, СҮР707А2,<br>СҮР707А3 | Encode for ABA8'hydroxylase; loss of dormancy   | Arabidopsis. thaliana, Hordeum<br>vulgare  | [17]                |
|   | ABI1, ABI2                      | Encode for Serine/threonine phosphatase 2C (PP2C) inducing seed dormancy  | Arabidopsis thaliana and monocot   | [80,114]            |
|   | ABI3/VP1                        | Regulation of chlorophyll, anthocyanin, and storage proteins accumulation with <i>FUS3</i> and <i>LEC1</i>  | Arabidopsis thaliana and monocot   | [17,124,125]        |
| ABA signalling                            |                                 | Regulated by WRKY41 and by DEP for primary seed dormancy establishment  | Arabidopsis thaliana and monocot   | [77,126,127]        |
| AbA signaling –                           | ABI4                            | Regulated by transcription factors CHO1 and SPT for dormancy establishment<br>and maintenance through NCED2 and NCED3; Represses CYP707A1<br>and CYP707A2 | Arabidopsis thaliana and monocot   | [77,128–130]        |
|   | ABI5                            | Regulated by <i>bZIP</i> transcription factor for positive ABA signalling and repressing seed germination   | Arabidopsis thaliana, Sorghum bicolor  | [77,131]            |
| GA biosynthesis —                         | GA3ox1, GA20ox3, KO1            | Inducing of hydrolytic enzymes that weaken the seed coat, inducing of mobilization of seed storage reserves, and stimulating of expansion of the embryo   | Arabidopsis thaliana and monocot   | [17,81,82]          |
|   | CPS                             | Catalyzed geranylgeranyl pyrophosphate (GGDP) cyclization reaction in the provascular tissue  | Arabidopsis thaliana   | [80]                |
|   | CTS                             | Encodes a peroxisomal protein of the ATP-binding cassette (ABC)<br>transporter class  | es a peroxisomal protein of the ATP-binding cassette (ABC)<br>transporter class Arabidopsis thaliana |                     |
|   | RGA, RGL1, RGL2, GAI            | Encode DELLA proteins as a repressor of GA signalling   | Arabidopsis thaliana   | [17,79,80,84]       |
| C A si su slin s                          | SLY1                            | GA relieves DELLA repression of seed germination by F-box protein   | Arabidopsis thaliana   | [17,85]             |
| GA signaling —                            | GID1                            | Induce release of seed dormancy by promoting interaction of DELLA with the F-box protein  | Arabidopsis thaliana, Oryza. sativa  | [81,132,133]        |
|   | GID2                            | Encodes for F-box subunits of an SCF E3 ubiquitin ligase that ubiquitinates DELLA proteins  | Arabidopsis thaliana, Oryza sativa   | [81,134–137]        |
|   | DOG1                            | Inhibition of genes encoding cell wall remodelling enzymes: <i>EXPA2, EXPA9, XTH19</i> by regulates the expression of GA biosynthesis genes               | Arabidopsis thaliana and monocot   | [86]                |
| GA catabolism (GA2ox2)                    | DDF1                            | Promotes transcription of the GA inactivation gene GA2ox7   | Arabidopsis thaliana   | [77,138]            |
| _   | EUI                             | Promoted by AP2 domain-containing transcription factor OsAP2-39 for GA inactivation   | Oryza sativa   | [77,139]            |

## Table 4. Processes and genes involved in seed dormancy regulation.

## Table 4. Cont.

| Process                      | Genes  | Description  | Related Species   | References       |
|------------------------------|--|--|---|------------------|
|                              | iaaM-OX  | Strong seed dormancy   | Triticum aestivum   | [89]             |
| Auxin                        | ARF10 and ARF16  | Activates ABI3 by perceiving high level of IAA for dormancy maintenance  | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [17.77.91]       |
|                              | AXR2/3   | Repress ARF10 and ARF16  | Arabidopsis thaliana  |                  |
|                              | ACO1, ACO4   | Ethylene biosynthesis genes  | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [17,140]         |
|                              | ETR1, ETR2 EIN2  | Contrasting roles for ABA biosynthesis during seed germination under<br>salt-stress conditions   | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [141]            |
| Ethylene                     | SNL1 and SNL2  | Reduce acetylation level of histone 3 lysine 9/18 and histone 3 lysine 14 repressing ABA accumulation at high level of ET                            | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [96]             |
|                              | SNL1 and SNL2  | Promote seed dormancy through simultaneous modulation of ACO1, ACO4<br>and CYP707A1, CYP707A2  | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [96]             |
| Brassinosteroid biosynthesis | TaDE-etiolated 2 ( <i>TaDET2</i> ) and<br><i>TaDWARF 4</i> | Ensure BR production in plant  | Triticum aestivum   | [17,99]          |
| Brassinosteroid signaling    | TaBR signalling kinase 2<br>( <i>TaBSK2</i> )              | Promote BR signalling  | Triticum aestivum   | [17,99]          |
|                              | MFT  | Forming a negative feedback loop to modulate ABA signalling  | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [142,143]        |
|                              | BIN2   | Key repressor of the BR signalling   | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [17,98]          |
| Jasmonic acid                | OPDA   | Promote effect of <i>ABA1</i> , <i>ABI5</i> , and <i>RGL2</i> and its regulatory action on <i>MFT</i> gene for seed dormancy maintenance             | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [17,77,100,144]. |
| Other genes                  | DOG1   | Shows strong dormancy  | Arabidopsis thaliana, Hordeum<br>vulgare, Triticum aestivum | [29,50–53,55]    |
|                              | DAG1 and DAG2  | Inhibiting germination by mediating <i>PIL5</i> activity as well as directly affecting gibberellin biosynthesis                                      | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [63,64]          |
|                              | DOF6   | Negatively regulates germination by affecting abscisic acid signalling in seeds  | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [60]             |
|                              | RDO2   | Encodes TFIIS for strong dormancy  | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [67]             |
|                              | GATA12   | Encodes a GATA-type zinc finger transcription factor for novel <i>RGL2–DOF6</i> complex enforcing primary seed dormancy via GA signalling repression | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [59,61,62]       |
|                              | NR (Nitrate reductase)                                     | Promotes dormancy release  | Arabidopsis thaliana  | [81,145]         |

#### 5. Environmental Factors Influencing Seed Dormancy Regulation

After-ripening, stratification, light, and seed components influence seed germinability. After-ripening refers to the transition period from a dormant to a more readily germinable seed, where the seed is submitted to a set of environmental conditions after maturation and separation from the mother plant [146]. For instance, in *Gynandropsis gynandra*, this period is supposed to last about three to six months after harvest [31].

Temperature affects ABA-GA balance resulting in either germination or strong dormancy [51,77,147]. In wheat, seed germination was highly affected by genotype and temperature. Seed dormancy increased when seeds were developed under 15 °C whereas seed germination increased when seeds were sown at 20 °C [148–150]. For some African traditional leafy vegetables, the maximum germination occurs at 29 to 36 °C with 36 °C for *Vigna unguiculata* L., 35 °C for *C. olitorius*, and 30 °C for *G. gynandra* [33,39].

Light also plays a crucial role in seed germination by inducing a secondary dormancy in imbibed after-ripened seeds, increasing the expression of GA biosynthesis genes and repressing the expression of GA catabolism gene through the action of phytochrome [151,152]. For instance, red (R) light inhibits the expression of NCED6, fared (FR) light inhibits the expression of CYP707A2, and blue light enhances the transcription of ABA biosynthetic genes NCED1 and NCED2 [77,153,154]. While germination of *G. gynandra* increase under dark conditions [39], light is supposed to positively affect germination of TLVs such as Amaranthus cruentus L., Brassica rapa L. subsp. chinensis, Corchorus olitorius, Citrullus lanatus Thunbs., and Solanum retroflexum Dun. [33]. It is therefore important not only to assess the temperature and light requirements during seed development, seed storage, and seed germination for TLVs seed germination but also to explore the induced changes at the hormonal level. Ochuodho and Modi [155] reported negative photosensitivity at 20 °C in continuous white light during the germination of G. gynandra, probably controlled by changes in ABA and GA content. In addition, genetic and physiological studies of seed dormancy highlighted the effect of interactions between light and temperature on seed dormancy regulation in A. thaliana [156]. Some of the relations between environmental factors and seed dormancy regulators in plants reviewed by Skubacz and Daszkowska-Golec [17] are summarized in Table 5.

| Environment Factors | Situations  | Role in Seed<br>Dormancy Regulation   | Description   | Species  |
|---------------------|---|---|---|--|
| After-ripening      |   |   | Positive relationship with CYP707A2<br>Induces GA insensitive dwarf1 <i>GID1b</i>   | Arabidopsis thaliana                           |
|                     | Seed dry storage<br>period at room<br>temperature | age Promotes expression of J.<br>biosynthesis genes: Allene o<br>om Reduced dormancy synthase (AOS), 3-ketoacyl coe<br>e A (KAT3) and Lipoxygenase 5 (<br>Induces GA200x1 and GA3 | Promotes expression of JA<br>biosynthesis genes: Allene oxide<br>synthase (AOS), 3-ketoacyl coenzyme<br>A (KAT3) and Lipoxygenase 5 (LOX5);<br>Induces GA200x1 and GA30x2 | Triticum aestivum                              |
|                     |   |   | Increases the expression of<br>ABA8'OH-1  | Hordeum vulgare,<br>Brachypodium<br>distachyon |
| Temperature         | •   | Reduced dormancy  | Promotes GA30x1 expression;<br>Represses GA20x2 gene  | Arabidopsis thaliana                           |
|                     | Low temperature                                   | Higher level of<br>dormancy during seed<br>development  | Activates MFT gene  | Triticum aestivum                              |
|                     | High temperature                                  | Increased dormancy<br>during seed imbibition  | Represses GA20ox1, GA20ox2,<br>GA20ox3, GA3ox1, and GA3ox2 genes;<br>Promotes the expression of ABA<br>biosynthesis genes   | Arabidopsis thaliana                           |
|                     | Red (R) light                                     | Reduced dormancy  | Inhibits the expression of NCED6  | Arabidopsis thaliana                           |
| Light               | Fared (FR) light                                  | Increase dormancy   | Inhibits the expression of CYP707A2   |  |
|                     | Blue light  | Increased dormancy  | Promotes NCED1, NCED2, GA2ox3<br>and GA2ox5 genes;<br>Represses GA3ox2  | Hordeum vulgare                                |

**Table 5.** Description of Environment factors and their role in seed dormancy regulation in plants reviewed by Skubacz and Daszkowska-Golec [17].

Seed coat components functions are related to flavonoids, which provide greater mechanical restraint and reduced permeability to water, gases, and hormones. Flavonoids can inhibit metabolic processes of after-ripening and germination. They provide protection from oxidative damage and the dehydration and desiccation tolerance of orthodox and recalcitrant seeds, which correlated with ABA and active oxygen species (AOS), respectively [81,157–159]. The seed coat or pod colour may be a good indication for seed physiological status and can provide insight on seed germination as reported in *G. gynandra* [41]. Adebo et al. [160] reported two colours for seed coat (black and brown) among *Corchorus olitorius* cultivars from Benin. In amaranth species, a *MYB*-like transcription factor gene controls the seed colour variation especially between the ancestor, which is black, and the domesticated species, which is white [161]. Most of the seed dormancy constraints observed in TLVs seeds are due to the seed coat structure. This may be probably due to the important content of flavonoids observed in TLVs species whether in leaf, shoot, and seed. Table 6 informs about flavonoid content in the seed and shoot of some African leafy vegetable species.

**Table 6.** Flavonoids content in some TLVs species. Values collected from Akubugwo et al. [162],Paśko et al. [163], Yang et al. [164].

| Species                   | Part  | Flavonoid (mg/100 g) |
|---------------------------|-------|----------------------|
| Gynandropsis gynandra     | Shoot | 64.3                 |
| Corchorus olitorius       | Shoot | 63.9                 |
| Solanum nigrum            | Seed  | 1.01                 |
| Amaranthus cruentus       | Seed  | 667                  |
| Chenopodium quinoa Willd. | Seed  | 2238                 |

## 7. Pathway for Dormancy Studies in Traditional Leafy Vegetables

Genetic and molecular approaches help find out the mechanisms underlying each step in the life cycle of plants [165]. The quantitative nature of seed dormancy should help identify whether seed dormancy of TLVs is controlled by nuclear or maternal factors or both. It is also important to know if the seed dormancy is genetically dominant or recessive or an outcome of a mutation. Factors that regulate germinability of seeds and their relationship for seed development and germination need to be investigated at different levels. Apart from temperature and light requirement, ecological significance of seed dormancy mechanism for TLVs should be understood. The current knowledge of dormancy established in well-studied crops such as A. thaliana and cereals will serve as baseline information to provide guidance for dormancy studies in TLVs. Therefore, researchers should be able to retrieve and put forward appropriate methodologies including definition of objectives and hypotheses, type of plant material (shoot, seed, source), conditions around implementation (seed development, seed storage, seed pre-treatments, seed germination), data collection, and analysis to perform genetic, genomic, and physiological screening of seed dormancy in TLVs. Studies can be specifically directed toward identification of the main seed dormancy regulators such as genes (DOG1, DAG, DOF, RDO, ABI3, GA3ox1, GA2ox3), transcription factors and proteins (ABA8'hydroxylase, CHO1, DELLA, GATA), abscisic–gibberellin acids crosstalk, non-enzymatic processes, seed morphological and structural components (endosperm, pericarp, embryo, seed coat), and the external factors (light, temperature, salinity, acidity, soil nitrate).

Seed characterization for a given TLV species will help identify the dormant and non-dormant genotypes and develop genetic populations for further studies. Figure 3 illustrates the conceptual approach leading to complete successful seed dormancy study in TLVs. This approach includes six steps from germplasm collection to the development of new varieties with high-quality seeds.



Figure 3. A conceptual approach for seed dormancy study in traditional leafy vegetables (TLVs) species. This proposed research avenue includes germplasm collection, germplasm characterization; development of mapping populations; quantitative trait loci (QTL) mapping; gene expression analysis; and new variety development. Germplasm collection is required in the range of distribution of the species for a developed core collection with cultivated and wild genotypes. Characterization of different factors influencing seed physiology and dormancy should help establish optimal germination conditions for fresh and after-ripened seeds and assess the natural variation of seed dormancy among genotypes. Development of mapping populations like biparental recombinant inbred lines (RILs), near-isogenic lines (NILs), F2, double haploid (HD), mutants, and multi-parental populations (multiparent advanced generation intercross (MAGIC)), multiparent recombinant inbred lines (AMPRIL)) will help access the genetic background existing among genotypes for seed dormancy. Development of molecular markers and use of modern genomic tools will lead to the successful implementation of mapping approaches such as in silico mapping, Bayesian mapping, linkage disequilibrium, multiple-QTL mapping, interval mapping, single marker-based, and marker regression for TLVs species. Tools such as expressed sequence tags (ESTs), serial analysis of gene expression (SAGE), massive parallel signature sequencing (MPSS), comparative genomics, microarray, and genome-wide association selection (GWAS) should be used for gene expression analysis. The development of improved varieties with high germination ability and many interest traits for farmers will be possible through Marker-assisted gene introgression, ultra-high-density bin map, and marker-assisted gene pyramiding.

#### 7.1. Germplasm Collection

The use of wild and cultivated populations should enhance the possibility to identify new regulators with ecological relevance. The majority of TLV species are still neglected and underutilized and are poorly represented or even not present in gene banks. The first important task to achieve will therefore be to conduct germplasm collection missions to assemble as much as possible the natural diversity in these species by considering the geographical range of distribution of each given species. Seeds, roots, leaves, or any part of the reproductive material of plant should be collected in both wild and cultivated populations, and made available for scientists and gene bank curators. A good example is the *Gynandropsis gynandra* core collections developed by the World Vegetable Center, National

Plant Germplasm System of the United States Department of Agriculture, and the Laboratory of Genetics, Horticulture and Seed Science at University of Abomey-Calavi-Benin [11]. Such initiatives will contribute to the preservation of the genetic resources of TLV in the current context of increasing genetic erosion due to climate change, urbanization, and industrialization.

#### 7.2. Seed Dormancy Characterization

Once germplasm collections are established or expanded, phenotypic characterization and genotypic characterization of seed dormancy related traits should be carried out. Phenotypic characterization includes variation in seed morphology and intrinsic germination capacity (radicle protrusion, seed, and seedling vigour). Seeds must be collected or developed at the same time for phenotypic characterization. Many studies of this type were conducted focusing on understanding the germination behaviour of various collections, comparisons of fresh dormant seed versus after-ripened non-dormant seeds, identifying light and temperature requirements, assessing the effects of various seed pre-treatments and seed origin [31,149,166]. These various experiments will lead to identifying populations with non-dormant seeds, populations with rather dormant seeds, and others with strong dormant seeds, in terms of germination rate, or time for dry storage to reach 50% germination or the number of days of seed dry storage required to reach 100% germination [49,167]. The genetic or molecular characterization of seed dormancy in mapping populations will be achieved using molecular markers as microsatellites or simple sequence repeats (SSR) and single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs). The combination of the data generated from the characterization will help predict the germination potential of the genotypes at an early stage of seed development. The observed variation about seed dormancy among populations could also be used to study gene expression profiles in different types of seeds. For instance, genetic and molecular dormancy investigations in Arabidopsis were performed using the reference accessions Landsberg erecta (Ler) and Colombia (Col) with low dormancy, the dormant accession Cape Verde Islands (Cvi), and various accessions with different levels of seed dormancy such as Antwerpen (An-1), St. Maria de Feira (Fei-0), Kondara (Kond), Shakdara (Sha), and Kashmir (Kas-2) [18,46,49,168]. Kepczynski et al. [36] have worked with primary dormant Amaranthus retroflexus seeds, secondary dormant Amaranthus paniculatus seeds, and non-dormant Amaranthus caudatus seeds.

#### 7.3. Development of Mapping Populations for Identification of Candidate Genes Involved in Seed Dormancy

Seed dormancy is a quantitative trait with agronomic importance. Various segregating populations reviewed by Keurentjes et al. [169] have been used for QTLs identification, namely recombinant inbred lines (RILs), Near-Isogenic Lines (NILS), Multiparent Advanced Generation Intercross (MAGIC), and Multiparent Recombinant Inbred Line (AMPRIL). Thus far, RILs, NILs, or backcross inbred lines populations developed via crossing dormant and non-dormant accessions have been used in many seed dormancy studies [49,170]. Mutant lines were developed referring to transgenic techniques through overexpression or downregulation of genes and compared with wild types [54,58,171,172]. Doubled haploids, recombinant inbred lines, and near-isogenic lines are the most important types of populations appear to be more powerful to help estimate both additive and dominance effects. Similar mapping populations should be developed for TLVs through mating systems such as diallel, nested, and factorial designs enabling to also assess the genetic variances and heritability of dormancy related trait.

The aim of developing mapping populations is to identify candidate loci and their relative contribution to the expression of seed dormancy behaviour. Several approaches have been developed for accuracy in QTLs detection such as single marker-based approaches, interval or LOD mapping, composite interval mapping, multiple interval mapping/multiple regression, marker regression, multiple-QTL mapping (MQM), Bayesian mapping, linkage disequilibrium mapping, meta-analysis, and in silico mapping [173,174]. For instance, the single marker regression and multiple-QTL mapping have been used in seed dormancy data analysis for *Arabidopsis thaliana* [18]. The heritability of major

QTLs through offspring will be important in the achievement of the breeding programs developed for traditional leafy vegetables.

The identified QTLs should help identify genes involved in cell organization and biogenesis, proteolysis, ribosomal proteins, hormones, elongation, and initiation factors that control seed dormancy in TLVs. Post-genomic analyses in previous studies about dormancy yielded interesting results through the use of proteomics, transcriptomics, metabolomics, and microarray analysis [175,176]. Their use should be focused on the comparison of transcription, post-transcription, gene expression either in imbibed seeds or fresh dormant seeds versus the non-dormant, after-ripened seeds. For example, a proteomic analysis of seed dormancy conducted in Arabidopsis with freshly harvested dormant seed and after-ripened non-dormant seed of accession Cvi revealed 71 proteins activities [177]; whereas 40 genes were reported by Li et al. [178] through the transcriptional profiling of imbibed Brassica napus L. seeds using Arabidopsis microarrays analysis. Various metabolic switches act during seed desiccation, vernalization, and early germination in Arabidopsis species [179] as well as in wheat [180]. In addition, genome-wide association analyses could provide a comprehensive understanding of gene activities in each of the three main regions of seed (coat, endosperm, embryo) during seed maturation, seed storage, and seed germination [181]. Comparative genomics will help construct strong phylogenies, identify changes in genome structure, annotate homologous genes, and understand novel traits [173,182]. Ayenan et al. [183] suggested the use of comparative genomics with rice to solve some of the constraints limiting the production of neglected African cereal crop fonio (Digitaria spp.). Comparative genomics is also relevant for TLVs genome screening as highlighted by Sogbohossou et al. [11] suggesting the use of available information on Brassica spp. and Arabidopsis thaliana genomes, Solanum lycopersicum and Solanum tuberosum L. genomes, and Amaranthus hypochondriacus L. and Chenopodium quinoa, respectively, for Gynandropsis gynandra and Brassica carinata, Solanum species (Solanum nigrum, Solanum marcrocarpon, Solanum aethiopium L., Solanum scabrum), and amaranths species (Amaranthus spp.).

#### 7.4. Tapping into Comparative Genomics to Study Seed Dormancy in TLVs

Arabidopsis thaliana, as well as Avena sativa, Solanum lycopersicum, and Nicotiana plumbaginifolia have been used to understand many genetic and molecular determinants involved in germination and seed dormancy control for plants [175]. Recently, Sogbohossou et al. [11] presented spider plant as a good model plant for TLVs breeding studies. Spider plant is a promising vegetable species for food security and income generation for African communities in urban and in rural areas [184]. In addition, the genome size of spider plant is relatively small (~800 Mb) with the possibility to obtain three generations per year and offers many options in terms of breeding strategies [11]. Cleomaceae family and Brassicaceae family are closely related, sharing the At- $\beta$  whole-genome duplication event within the Brassicales with fast molecular evolution rates [185]. Marshall et al. [186] argued the possibility to isolate orthologs of *Arabidopsis* genes from *Gynandropsis gynandra*, and van den Bergh et al. [187] reported that the genomes of *Gynandropsis gynandra* and *Arabidopsis thaliana* shared significant synteny, which will facilitate translational genomics between both species.

Seed dormancy is strongly reported in spider plant. Previous studies reviewed by Shilla et al. [31] support the assumption that spider plant accessions differ largely in their seed dormancy behaviour where the germination activation extends from zero (0) to more than six (6) months. Such a variation in the seed behaviour offers an opportunity to determine QTLs associated with germination in the species. *Gynandropsis gynandra* can be used as model plant for seed dormancy studies in plants the same way *Thellungiella salsuginea* has been used to investigate the physiological, metabolic, and molecular mechanisms of abiotic stress tolerance in plants [188]. Large physiological, genetic, and biochemical data should therefore be generated in spider plant for further investigations. As one of the priority species for the Mobility for Breeders in Africa project (in short "Mobreed") [189], some studies on *G. gynandra* are underway and will certainly provide us with more information about the potential of its genome. The use of comparative genomics, macrosynteny, and microsynteny is an alternative for the understanding of the seed dormancy determinants for *G. gynandra* and the generation of knowledge

regarding molecular markers, QTLs, candidate genes and their functions [190,191]. The development of DNA molecular markers should accelerate *G. gynandra* plant breeding as diversity arrays technology (DArT) and single nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) markers can be used to locate seed dormancy genes across *G. gynandra* germplasm [192]. Once candidate genes are identified, the development of populations with different genetic backgrounds such as NILs, F2, or a backcross population are important for gene introgression and validation. Simple sequence repeats (SSRs) markers have been successfully used in this way for various crops. The multi-environment experiment is a factor related directly to the efficiency of the identified genes. The way of mutant development can also be explored for new allele identification compared to the wild phenotype.

The knowledge established with the model plant (*G. gynandra*) can be transferred to other TLVs species through the development of a platform integrating genomics, transcriptomics, phenomics, and ontology analyses [193]. For instance, Mutwil et al. [194] established whole-genome coexpression networks for Arabidopsis, barley, rice, Medicago, poplar, wheat, and soybean that may considerably improve the transfer of knowledge generated in *Arabidopsis* to crop species. The isolation and functional analysis of homologs/QTLs should clearly help characterize all the genes and understand their interaction with each other. The understanding of others genetic phenomena of economical traits such as late-flowering date, leaf yield, and disease resistance, should help develop cultivars combining several good characteristics for farmers. The construction of ultra-high-density genetic maps is therefore essential to perform gene transfer through marker-assisted gene introgression and marker-assisted gene pyramiding [195].

#### 8. Conclusions

This review sheds light onto a better understanding of the regulation of seed dormancy and the main factors known to be involved in the control of seed dormancy at hormonal, transcriptomic, epigenetic, protein, and environmental levels. The abscisic-gibberellin acids (ABA-GA) balance is a key component involved in the indirect control of seed dormancy that determines whether seeds may germinate or not. Auxin and salicylic acid (SA) promote seed dormancy; jasmonic acid (JA), brassinosteroids (BRs) and ethylene (ET) play a dual role in seed dormancy regulation, and cytokinin (CTKs) promotes seed germination. Other dormancy regulators were shown to directly promote or repress the decision of seeds to germinate. Those include genes such as Delay of Germination (DOG), DOF affecting germination (DAG), and reduced dormancy (RDO). For Gynandropsis gynandra and other TLVs, research is needed to solve the seed dormancy constraints and to provide prospective producers with high-quality seeds. Gynandropsis gynandra, a closely related species to Arabidopsis thaliana, was considered as a model plant to propose a pathway into solving the dormancy constraints in TLVs. This proposed research avenue includes germplasm collection, germplasm characterization, development of mapping populations, QTL mapping; gene expression analysis, and a new of variety development. Therefore, research is needed to highlight the specific storage conditions and seed pre-treatment required to ensure the seed viability and germination of genotypes. The mechanisms occurring during after-ripening in G. gynandra should also be elucidated. Rapid progress for G. gynandra full domestication should be achieved starting with the analysis of the natural variation in seed dormancy in the available genotype collections. Further steps include the characterization of the different factors influencing seed physiology, dormancy, and dormancy-breaking approaches. The identification of major genetic and molecular factors underlying seed dormancy during seed development, seed storage, and germination needs to be elucidated for developing cultivars that farmers can effectively use. Multidisciplinary research teams including physiologists, geneticists, and bioinformaticians are therefore required to quickly and efficiently make significant progress toward breeding for non-dormancy in traditional leafy vegetables.

**Author Contributions:** E.G.A.-D. and F.S.S. developed the conceptual framework of the manuscript. F.S.S. wrote the manuscript. H.P.F.Z., C.A.H., D.E.O.S., and E.G.A.-D. reviewed and approved the final version. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

**Funding:** This work was supported by the Applied Research Fund of the Netherlands Organization for Science under the Project "Utilizing the genome of the vegetable species *Cleome gynandra* for the development of improved cultivars for the West and East African markets" (Project Number: W.08.270.350).

Acknowledgments: We thank the editors for the interactive improvement of the manuscript.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

## References

- 1. Achigan-Dako, E.G.; N'Danikou, S.; Assogba-Komlan, F.; Ambrose-Oji, B.; Ahanchede, A.; Pasquini, M.W. Diversity, geographical, and consumption patterns of traditional vegetables in sociolinguistic communities in Benin: Implications for domestication and utilization. *Econ. Bot.* **2011**, *65*, 129–145. [CrossRef]
- 2. Kahane, R.; Temple, L.; Brat, P.; De Bon, H. Les légumes feuilles des pays tropicaux: Diversité, richesse économique et valeur santé dans un contexte très fragile. In Proceedings of the Colloque Les légumes: Un Patrimoine à Transmettre et à Valoriser, Angers, France, 7–9 September 2005.
- Maundu, P.; Achigan-Dako, E.; Morimoto, Y. Biodiversity of African vegetables. In *African Indigenous Vegetables in Urban Agriculture*; Shackleton, C.M., Pasquini, M.W., Drescher, A.W., Eds.; Routledge: London, UK, 2009; pp. 97–136.
- 4. Towns, A.M.; Shackleton, C. Traditional, Indigenous, or Leafy? A Definition, Typology, and Way Forward for African Vegetables. *Econ. Bot.* **2018**, *72*, 461–477. [CrossRef]
- Uzilday, B.; Turkan, I.; Sekmen, A.; Ozgur, R.; Karakaya, H. Comparison of ROS formation and antioxidant enzymes in *Cleome gynandra* (C4) and *Cleome spinosa* (C3) under drought stress. *Plant Sci.* 2012, *182*, 59–70. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 6. Luoh, J.W.; Begg, C.B.; Symonds, R.C.; Ledesma, D.; Yang, R.-Y. Nutritional yield of African indigenous vegetables in water-deficient and water-sufficient conditions. *Food Nutr. Sci.* **2014**, *5*, 812. [CrossRef]
- Kansiime, M.K.; Karanja, D.K.; Alokit, C.; Ochieng, J. Derived demand for African indigenous vegetable seed: Implications for farmer-seed entrepreneurship development. *Int. Food Agribus. Manag. Rev.* 2018, 21, 723–739. [CrossRef]
- 8. Abukutsa-Onyango, M. Seed production and support systems for African Leafy Vegetables in three communities In Western Kenya. *Afr. J. Food Agric. Nutr. Dev.* **2006**, *7*, 108–116.
- 9. Dube, P.; Struik, P.C.; Ngadze, E. Seed health tests of traditional leafy vegetables and pathogenicity in plants. *Afr. J. Agric. Res.* **2018**, *13*, 753–770.
- 10. Adebooye, O.; Ajayi, S.; Baidu-Forson, J.; Opabode, J. Seed constraint to cultivation and productivity of African indigenous leaf vegetables. *Afr. J. Biotechnol.* **2005**, *4*, 1480–1484.
- 11. Sogbohossou, E.D.; Achigan-Dako, E.G.; Maundu, P.; Solberg, S.; Deguenon, E.M.; Mumm, R.H.; Hale, I.; Van Deynze, A.; Schranz, M.E. A roadmap for breeding orphan leafy vegetable species: A case study of *Gynandropsis gynandra* (Cleomaceae). *Hortic. Res.* **2018**, *5*, 1–15. [CrossRef]
- 12. Baskin, J.M.; Baskin, C.C. A classification system for seed dormancy. Seed Sci. Res. 2004, 14, 1–16. [CrossRef]
- 13. Hilhorst, H.W. Standardizing seed dormancy research. In *Seed Dormancy*; Kermode, A.R., Ed.; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 2011; Volume 773, pp. 43–52.
- 14. Fenner, M.; Thompson, K. *The Ecology of Seeds*; Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK, 2006; p. 260.
- 15. Bewley, J.D. Seed germination and dormancy. *Plant Cell* **1997**, *9*, 1055. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 16. Bewley, J.D.; Black, M. Seeds. In *Seeds Physiology of Development and Germination*, 3rd ed.; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany; Plenum Press: New York, NY, USA, 1994; pp. 1–33.
- 17. Skubacz, A.; Daszkowska-Golec, A. Seed Dormancy: The Complex Process Regulated by Abscisic Acid, Gibberellins, and Other Phytohormones that Makes Seed Germination Work. In *Phytohormones-Signaling Mechanisms and Crosstalk in Plant Development and Stress Responses*; El-Esawi, M., Ed.; InTech: Vienna, Austria, 2017; pp. 77–100.
- Van der Schaar, W.; Alonso-Blanco, C.; Léon-Kloosterziel, K.M.; Jansen, R.C.; Van Ooijen, J.W.; Koornneef, M. QTL analysis of seed dormancy in Arabidopsis using recombinant inbred lines and MQM mapping. *Heredity* 1997, 79, 190–200. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 19. Lin, M.; Liu, S.; Zhang, G.; Bai, G. Effects of TaPHS1 and TaMKK3-A Genes on Wheat Pre-Harvest Sprouting Resistance. *Agronomy* **2018**, *8*, 210. [CrossRef]

- Li, C.; Ni, P.; Francki, M.; Hunter, A.; Zhang, Y.; Schibeci, D.; Li, H.; Tarr, A.; Wang, J.; Cakir, M. Genes controlling seed dormancy and pre-harvest sprouting in a rice-wheat-barley comparison. *Funct. Integr. enom.* 2004, *4*, 84–93. [CrossRef]
- 21. Debieu, M.; Tang, C.; Stich, B.; Sikosek, T.; Effgen, S.; Josephs, E.; Schmitt, J.; Nordborg, M.; Koornneef, M.; de Meaux, J. Co-variation between seed dormancy, growth rate and flowering time changes with latitude in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *PLoS ONE* **2013**, *8*, e61075. [CrossRef]
- 22. Hawkins, K.; Allen, P.; Meyer, S. Secondary dormancy induction and release in *Bromus tectorum* seeds: The role of temperature, water potential and hydrothermal time. *Seed Sci. Res.* **2017**, *27*, 12–25. [CrossRef]
- 23. Koornneef, M.; Alonso-Blanco, C.; Vreugdenhil, D. Naturally occurring genetic variation in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Annu. Rev. Plant Biol.* **2004**, *55*, 141–172. [CrossRef]
- 24. Zardilis, A.; Hume, A.; Millar, A.J. A multi-model framework for the Arabidopsis life cycle. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2019**, 70, 2463–2477. [CrossRef]
- 25. Lu, Q.; Niu, X.; Zhang, M.; Wang, C.; Xu, Q.; Feng, Y.; Yang, Y.; Wang, S.; Yuan, X.; Yu, H. Genome-wide association study of seed dormancy and the genomic consequences of improvement footprints in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Front. Plant Sci.* **2018**, *8*, 2213. [CrossRef]
- Ali, A.; Cao, J.; Jiang, H.; Chang, C.; Zhang, H.-P.; Sheikh, S.W.; Shah, L.; Ma, C. Unraveling Molecular and Genetic Studies of Wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) Resistance against Factors Causing Pre-Harvest Sprouting. *Agronomy* 2019, 9, 117. [CrossRef]
- 27. Cota-Sánchez, J.H. Precocious Germination (Vivipary) in Tomato: A Link to Economic Loss? *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. India Sect. B Biol. Sci.* **2018**, *88*, 1443–1451. [CrossRef]
- 28. Miransari, M.; Smith, D. Plant hormones and seed germination. *Environ. Exp. Bot.* **2014**, *99*, 110–121. [CrossRef]
- 29. Née, G.; Xiang, Y.; Soppe, W.J. The release of dormancy, a wake-up call for seeds to germinate. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* **2017**, *35*, 8–14. [CrossRef]
- 30. Baskin, J.M.; Baskin, C.C. New approaches to the study of the evolution of physical and physiological dormancy, the two most common classes of seed dormancy on earth. In *The Biology of Seeds: Recent Research Advances*; Nicolás, G., Bradford, K., Côme, D., Pritchard, H.W., Eds.; CAB International: Wallingford, UK, 2003; pp. 371–380.
- 31. Shilla, O.; Abukutsa-Onyango, M.O.; Dinssa, F.F.; Winkelmann, T. Seed dormancy, viability and germination of *Cleome gynandra* (L.) *BRIQ. Afr. J. Hortic. Sci.* **2017**, *10*, 45–52.
- 32. Baskin, C.; Baskin, J. *Seeds: Ecology, Biogeography, and Evolution of Dormancy and Germination,* 2nd ed.; Elsevier: Amsterdam, The Netherlands; Academic Press: San Diego, CA, USA, 2014.
- 33. Motsa, M.; Slabbert, M.; Van Averbeke, W.; Morey, L. Effect of light and temperature on seed germination of selected African leafy vegetables. *S. Afr. J. Bot.* **2015**, *99*, 29–35. [CrossRef]
- 34. Taab, A.; Andersson, L. Primary dormancy and seedling emergence of black nightshade (*Solanum nigrum*) and hairy nightshade (*Solanum physalifolium*). *Weed Sci.* **2009**, *57*, 526–532. [CrossRef]
- 35. Agble, F. Germination of seeds of *Talinum triangulare*. *Ghana J. Sci.* **1970**, *10*, 29–32.
- Kępczynski, J.; Bihun, M.; Kępczynska, E. Ethylene Involvement in the Dormancy of Amaranthus Seeds. In *Biology and Biotechnology of the Plant Hormone Ethylene*; Kanellis, A.K., Chang, C., Kende, H., Grierson, D., Eds.; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 1997; pp. 113–122.
- 37. Roberts, H.; Lockett, P.M. Seed dormancy and field emergence in *Solanum nigrum* L. *Weed Res.* **1978**, *18*, 231–241. [CrossRef]
- 38. Geneve, R.L. Seed dormancy in commercial vegetable and flower species. Seed Technol. 1998, 236–250.
- 39. Ochuodho, J.; Modi, A. Temperature and light requirements for the germination of *Cleome gynandra* seeds. *S. Afr. J. Plant Soil* **2005**, *22*, 49–54. [CrossRef]
- 40. Ekpong, B. Effects of seed maturity, seed storage and pre-germination treatments on seed germination of cleome (*Cleome gynandra* L.). *Sci. Hortic.* **2009**, *119*, 236–240. [CrossRef]
- 41. Kamotho, G.; Mathenge, P.; Muasya, R.; Dullo, M. Effects of maturity stage, desiccation and storage period on seed quality of cleome (*Cleome gynandra* L.). *Res. Desk* **2014**, *3*, 419–433.
- 42. Yepes, J. Study of a weed Cleome gynandra L. Rev. Comalfi 1978, 5, 49-53.
- 43. Zharare, G. Differential requirements for breaking seed dormancy in biotypes of *Cleome gynandra* and two Amaranthus species. *Afr. J. Agric. Res.* **2012**, *7*, 5049–5059.

- 44. Enayati, V.; Esfandiari, E.; Pourmohammad, A.; Haj Mohammadnia Ghalibaf, K. Evaluation of different methods in seed dormancy breaking and germination of Redroot Pigweed (*Amaranthus retroflexus*). *Iran. J. Seed Res.* **2019**, *5*, 129–137. [CrossRef]
- 45. Foley, M.E. Seed dormancy: An update on terminology, physiological genetics, and quantitative trait loci regulating germinability. *Weed Sci.* **2001**, *49*, 305–317. [CrossRef]
- 46. Alonso-Blanco, C.; Bentsink, L.; Hanhart, C.J.; Blankestijn-de Vries, H.; Koornneef, M. Analysis of natural allelic variation at seed dormancy loci of *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Genetics* **2003**, *164*, 711–729.
- 47. Kondou, Y.; Higuchi, M.; Takahashi, S.; Sakurai, T.; Ichikawa, T.; Kuroda, H.; Yoshizumi, T.; Tsumoto, Y.; Horii, Y.; Kawashima, M. Systematic approaches to using the FOX hunting system to identify useful rice genes. *Plant J.* **2009**, *57*, 883–894. [CrossRef]
- 48. Teng, S.; Rognoni, S.; Bentsink, L.; Smeekens, S. The Arabidopsis GSQ5/DOG1 Cvi allele is induced by the ABA-mediated sugar signalling pathway, and enhances sugar sensitivity by stimulating ABI4 expression. *Plant J.* **2008**, *55*, 372–381. [CrossRef]
- Bentsink, L.; Hanson, J.; Hanhart, C.J.; Blankestijn-de Vries, H.; Coltrane, C.; Keizer, P.; El-Lithy, M.; Alonso-Blanco, C.; de Andrés, M.T.; Reymond, M. Natural variation for seed dormancy in Arabidopsis is regulated by additive genetic and molecular pathways. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2010, 107, 4264–4269. [CrossRef]
- 50. Chiang, G.C.; Bartsch, M.; Barua, D.; Nakabayashi, K.; Debieu, M.; Kronholm, I.; Koornneef, M.; Soppe, W.J.; Donohue, K.; de Meaux, J. DOG1 expression is predicted by the seed-maturation environment and contributes to geographical variation in germination in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Mol. Ecol.* **2011**, *20*, 3336–3349. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 51. Kendall, S.L.; Hellwege, A.; Marriot, P.; Whalley, C.; Graham, I.A.; Penfield, S. Induction of dormancy in Arabidopsis summer annuals requires parallel regulation of DOG1 and hormone metabolism by low temperature and CBF transcription factors. *Plant Cell* **2011**, *23*, 2568–2580. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 52. Nakabayashi, K.; Bartsch, M.; Xiang, Y.; Miatton, E.; Pellengahr, S.; Yano, R.; Seo, M.; Soppe, W.J. The time required for dormancy release in Arabidopsis is determined by DELAY OF GERMINATION1 protein levels in freshly harvested seeds. *Plant Cell* **2012**, *24*, 2826–2838. [CrossRef]
- Nonogaki, H. Seed dormancy and germination—Emerging mechanisms and new hypotheses. *Front. Plant Sci.* 2014, 5, 233. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 54. Ashikawa, I.; Abe, F.; Nakamura, S. DOG1-like genes in cereals: Investigation of their function by means of ectopic expression in Arabidopsis. *Plant Sci.* **2013**, *208*, 1–9. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 55. Bentsink, L.; Jowett, J.; Hanhart, C.J.; Koornneef, M. Cloning of DOG1, a quantitative trait locus controlling seed dormancy in Arabidopsis. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **2006**, *103*, 17042–17047. [CrossRef]
- 56. Sugimoto, K.; Takeuchi, Y.; Ebana, K.; Miyao, A.; Hirochika, H.; Hara, N.; Ishiyama, K.; Kobayashi, M.; Ban, Y.; Hattori, T. Molecular cloning of Sdr4, a regulator involved in seed dormancy and domestication of rice. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **2010**, *107*, 5792–5797. [CrossRef]
- 57. Graeber, K.; Voegele, A.; Büttner-Mainik, A.; Sperber, K.; Mummenhoff, K.; Leubner-Metzger, G. Spatiotemporal seed development analysis provides insight into primary dormancy induction and evolution of the Lepidium DELAY OF GERMINATION1 genes. *Plant Physiol.* **2013**, *161*, 1903–1917. [CrossRef]
- 58. Ashikawa, I.; Abe, F.; Nakamura, S. Ectopic expression of wheat and barley DOG1-like genes promotes seed dormancy in Arabidopsis. *Plant Sci.* **2010**, *179*, 536–542. [CrossRef]
- 59. Boccaccini, A.; Santopolo, S.; Capauto, D.; Lorrai, R.; Minutello, E.; Serino, G.; Costantino, P.; Vittorioso, P. The DOF protein DAG1 and the DELLA protein GAI cooperate in negatively regulating the AtGA3ox1 gene. *BMC Plant Biol.* **2014**, *7*, 1486–1489. [CrossRef]
- 60. Rueda-Romero, P.; Barrero-Sicilia, C.; Gómez-Cadenas, A.; Carbonero, P.; Oñate-Sánchez, L. *Arabidopsis thaliana* DOF6 negatively affects germination in non-after-ripened seeds and interacts with TCP14. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2011**, *63*, 1937–1949. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 61. Ravindran, P.; Verma, V.; Stamm, P.; Kumar, P.P. A novel RGL2–DOF6 complex contributes to primary seed dormancy in *Arabidopsis thaliana* by regulating a GATA transcription factor. *Mol. Plant* **2017**, *10*, 1307–1320. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 62. Stamm, P.; Ravindran, P.; Mohanty, B.; Tan, E.L.; Yu, H.; Kumar, P.P. Insights into the molecular mechanism of RGL2-mediated inhibition of seed germination in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *BMC Plant Biol.* **2012**, *12*, 179. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- 63. Gabriele, S.; Rizza, A.; Martone, J.; Circelli, P.; Costantino, P.; Vittorioso, P. The Dof protein DAG1 mediates PIL5 activity on seed germination by negatively regulating GA biosynthetic gene AtGA3ox1. *Plant J.* **2010**, *61*, 312–323. [CrossRef]
- 64. Gualberti, G.; Papi, M.; Bellucci, L.; Ricci, I.; Bouchez, D.; Camilleri, C.; Costantino, P.; Vittorioso, P. Mutations in the Dof zinc finger genes DAG2 and DAG1 influence with opposite effects the germination of Arabidopsis seeds. *Plant Cell* **2002**, *14*, 1253–1263. [CrossRef]
- 65. Léon-Kloosterziel, K.M.; van de Bunt, G.A.; Zeevaart, J.A.; Koornneef, M. Arabidopsis mutants with a reduced seed dormancy. *Plant Physiol.* **1996**, *110*, 233–240. [CrossRef]
- 66. Peeters, A.J.; Blankestijn-de Vries, H.; Hanhart, C.J.; Léon-Kloosterziel, K.M.; Zeevaart, J.A.; Koornneef, M. Characterization of mutants with reduced seed dormancy at two novel rdo loci and a further characterization of rdo1 and rdo2 in Arabidopsis. *Physiol. Plant* **2002**, *115*, 604–612. [CrossRef]
- 67. Liu, Y.; Geyer, R.; Van Zanten, M.; Carles, A.; Li, Y.; Hörold, A.; van Nocker, S.; Soppe, W.J. Identification of the Arabidopsis REDUCED DORMANCY 2 gene uncovers a role for the polymerase associated factor 1 complex in seed dormancy. *PLoS ONE* **2011**, *6*, 22241. [CrossRef]
- 68. Grasser, M.; Kane, C.M.; Merkle, T.; Melzer, M.; Emmersen, J.; Grasser, K.D. Transcript elongation factor TFIIS is involved in Arabidopsis seed dormancy. *J. Mol. Biol.* **2009**, *386*, 598–611. [CrossRef]
- 69. Liu, Y.; Koornneef, M.; Soppe, W.J. The absence of histone H2B monoubiquitination in the Arabidopsis hub1 (rdo4) mutant reveals a role for chromatin remodeling in seed dormancy. *Plant Cell* **2007**, *19*, 433–444. [CrossRef]
- Yazdanpanah, F.; Hanson, J.; Hilhorst, H.W.; Bentsink, L. Differentially expressed genes during the imbibition of dormant and after-ripened seeds—A reverse genetics approach. *BMC Plant Biol.* 2017, 17, 151–162. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 71. Finkelstein, R.R.; Gampala, S.S.; Rock, C.D. Abscisic acid signaling in seeds and seedlings. *Plant Cell Online* **2002**, *14*, S15–S45. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 72. Flematti, G.R.; Ghisalberti, E.L.; Dixon, K.W.; Trengove, R.D. A compound from smoke that promotes seed germination. *Science* 2004, *305*, 977. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 73. Kanno, Y.; Jikumaru, Y.; Hanada, A.; Nambara, E.; Abrams, S.R.; Kamiya, Y.; Seo, M. Comprehensive hormone profiling in developing Arabidopsis seeds: Examination of the site of ABA biosynthesis, ABA transport and hormone interactions. *Plant Cell Physiol.* **2010**, *51*, 1988–2001. [CrossRef]
- 74. Nambara, E.; Marion-Poll, A. ABA action and interactions in seeds. *Trends Plant Sci.* 2003, *8*, 213–217. [CrossRef]
- 75. Frey, A.; Effroy, D.; Lefebvre, V.; Seo, M.; Perreau, F.; Berger, A.; Sechet, J.; To, A.; North, H.M.; Marion-Poll, A. Epoxycarotenoid cleavage by NCED5 fine-tunes ABA accumulation and affects seed dormancy and drought tolerance with other NCED family members. *Plant J.* **2012**, *70*, 501–512. [CrossRef]
- 76. Shu, K.; Zhang, H.; Wang, S.; Chen, M.; Wu, Y.; Tang, S.; Liu, C.; Feng, Y.; Cao, X.; Xie, Q. ABI4 regulates primary seed dormancy by regulating the biogenesis of abscisic acid and gibberellins in Arabidopsis. *PLoS Genet.* **2013**, *9*, e1003577. [CrossRef]
- 77. Shu, K.; Liu, X.-D.; Xie, Q.; He, Z.-H. Two faces of one seed: Hormonal regulation of dormancy and germination. *Mol. Plant* **2016**, *9*, 34–45. [CrossRef]
- 78. Kim, W.; Lee, Y.; Park, J.; Lee, N.; Choi, G. HONSU, a protein phosphatase 2C, regulates seed dormancy by inhibiting ABA signaling in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell Physiol.* **2013**, *54*, 555–572. [CrossRef]
- 79. Umezawa, T.; Sugiyama, N.; Mizoguchi, M.; Hayashi, S.; Myouga, F.; Yamaguchi-Shinozaki, K.; Ishihama, Y.; Hirayama, T.; Shinozaki, K. Type 2C protein phosphatases directly regulate abscisic acid-activated protein kinases in Arabidopsis. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **2009**, *106*, 17588–17593. [CrossRef]
- 80. Kucera, B.; Cohn, M.A.; Leubner-Metzger, G. Plant hormone interactions during seed dormancy release and germination. *Seed Sci. Res.* 2005, *15*, 281–307. [CrossRef]
- Finkelstein, R.; Reeves, W.; Ariizumi, T.; Steber, C. Molecular aspects of seed dormancy. *Annu. Rev. Plant Biol.* 2008, 59, 387–415. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 82. Gómez-Cadenas, A.; Zentella, R.; Walker-Simmons, M.K.; Ho, T.-H.D. Gibberellin/abscisic acid antagonism in barley aleurone cells: Site of action of the protein kinase PKABA1 in relation to gibberellin signaling molecules. *Plant Cell* **2001**, *13*, 667–679. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- 83. Footitt, S.; Slocombe, S.P.; Larner, V.; Kurup, S.; Wu, Y.; Larson, T.; Graham, I.; Baker, A.; Holdsworth, M. Control of germination and lipid mobilization by COMATOSE, the Arabidopsis homologue of human ALDP. *EMBO J.* **2002**, *21*, 2912–2922. [CrossRef]
- 84. Cao, D.; Hussain, A.; Cheng, H.; Peng, J. Loss of function of four DELLA genes leads to light-and gibberellin-independent seed germination in Arabidopsis. *Planta* **2005**, *223*, 105–113. [CrossRef]
- Tyler, L.; Thomas, S.G.; Hu, J.; Dill, A.; Alonso, J.M.; Ecker, J.R.; Sun, T.-P. DELLA proteins and gibberellin-regulated seed germination and floral development in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.* 2004, 135, 1008–1019. [CrossRef]
- Graeber, K.; Linkies, A.; Steinbrecher, T.; Mummenhoff, K.; Tarkowská, D.; Turečková, V.; Ignatz, M.; Sperber, K.; Voegele, A.; de Jong, H. DELAY OF GERMINATION1 mediates a conserved coat-dormancy mechanism for the temperature-and gibberellin-dependent control of seed germination. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2014, *111*, 3571–3580. [CrossRef]
- 87. Cantoro, R.; Crocco, C.D.; Benech-Arnold, R.L.; Rodríguez, M.V. In vitro binding of *Sorghum bicolor* transcription factors ABI4 and ABI5 to a conserved region of a GA 2-OXIDASE promoter: Possible role of this interaction in the expression of seed dormancy. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2013**, *64*, 5721–5735. [CrossRef]
- Park, J.; Kim, Y.-S.; Kim, S.-G.; Jung, J.-H.; Woo, J.-C.; Park, C.-M. Integration of auxin and salt signals by the NAC transcription factor NTM2 during seed germination in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.* 2011, 156, 537–549. [CrossRef]
- 89. Ramaih, S.; Guedira, M.; Paulsen, G.M. Relationship of indoleacetic acid and tryptophan to dormancy and preharvest sprouting of wheat. *Funct. Plant Biol.* **2003**, *30*, 939–945. [CrossRef]
- Liu, A.; Gao, F.; Kanno, Y.; Jordan, M.C.; Kamiya, Y.; Seo, M.; Ayele, B.T. Regulation of wheat seed dormancy by after-ripening is mediated by specific transcriptional switches that induce changes in seed hormone metabolism and signaling. *PLoS ONE* 2013, *8*, e56570. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 91. Liu, X.; Zhang, H.; Zhao, Y.; Feng, Z.; Li, Q.; Yang, H.-Q.; Luan, S.; Li, J.; He, Z.-H. Auxin controls seed dormancy through stimulation of abscisic acid signaling by inducing ARF-mediated ABI3 activation in Arabidopsis. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **2013**, *110*, 15485–15490. [CrossRef]
- Belin, C.; Megies, C.; Hauserová, E.; Lopez-Molina, L. Abscisic acid represses growth of the Arabidopsis embryonic axis after germination by enhancing auxin signaling. *Plant Cell* 2009, 21, 2253–2268. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 93. Arc, E.; Sechet, J.; Corbineau, F.; Rajjou, L.; Marion-Poll, A. ABA crosstalk with ethylene and nitric oxide in seed dormancy and germination. *Front. Plant Sci.* **2013**, *4*, 1–19. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 94. Corbineau, F.; Xia, Q.; Bailly, C.; El-Maarouf-Bouteau, H. Ethylene, a key factor in the regulation of seed dormancy. *Front. Plant Sci.* **2014**, *5*, 539. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 95. Subbiah, V.; Reddy, K.J. Interactions between ethylene, abscisic acid and cytokinin during germination and seedling establishment in Arabidopsis. *J. BioSci. (Bangalore)* **2010**, *35*, 451–458. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 96. Wang, Z.; Cao, H.; Sun, Y.; Li, X.; Chen, F.; Carles, A.; Li, Y.; Ding, M.; Zhang, C.; Deng, X. Arabidopsis paired amphipathic helix proteins SNL1 and SNL2 redundantly regulate primary seed dormancy via abscisic acid–ethylene antagonism mediated by histone deacetylation. *Plant Cell* **2013**, *25*, 149–166. [CrossRef]
- 97. Steber, C.M.; McCourt, P. A role for brassinosteroids in germination in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.* **2001**, *125*, 763–769. [CrossRef]
- Hu, Y.; Yu, D. BRASSINOSTEROID INSENSITIVE2 interacts with ABSCISIC ACID INSENSITIVE5 to mediate the antagonism of brassinosteroids to abscisic acid during seed germination in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell* 2014, 26, 4394–4408. [CrossRef]
- 99. Chitnis, V.R.; Gao, F.; Yao, Z.; Jordan, M.C.; Park, S.; Ayele, B.T. After-ripening induced transcriptional changes of hormonal genes in wheat seeds: The cases of brassinosteroids, ethylene, cytokinin and salicylic acid. *PLoS ONE* **2014**, *9*, 87543. [CrossRef]
- 100. Nambara, E.; Okamoto, M.; Tatematsu, K.; Yano, R.; Seo, M.; Kamiya, Y. Abscisic acid and the control of seed dormancy and germination. *Seed Sci. Res.* **2010**, *20*, 55–67. [CrossRef]
- 101. Jacobsen, J.V.; Barrero, J.M.; Hughes, T.; Julkowska, M.; Taylor, J.M.; Xu, Q.; Gubler, F. Roles for blue light, jasmonate and nitric oxide in the regulation of dormancy and germination in wheat grain (*Triticum aestivum* L.). *Planta* **2013**, *238*, 121–138. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 102. Xu, Q.; Truong, T.T.; Barrero, J.M.; Jacobsen, J.V.; Hocart, C.H.; Gubler, F. A role for jasmonates in the release of dormancy by cold stratification in wheat. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2016**, *67*, 3497–3508. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- Xie, Z.; Zhang, Z.-L.; Hanzlik, S.; Cook, E.; Shen, Q.J. Salicylic acid inhibits gibberellin-induced alpha-amylase expression and seed germination via a pathway involving an abscisic-acid-inducible WRKY gene. *Plant Mol. Biol.* 2007, *64*, 293–303. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 104. Lee, S.; Kim, S.G.; Park, C.M. Salicylic acid promotes seed germination under high salinity by modulating antioxidant activity in Arabidopsis. *New Phytol.* **2010**, *188*, 626–637. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 105. Dewar, J.; Taylor, J.; Berjak, P. Changes in selected plant growth regulators during germination in sorghum. *Seed Sci. Res.* **1998**, *8*, 1–8. [CrossRef]
- 106. Cook, C.; Whichard, L.P.; Turner, B.; Wall, M.E.; Egley, G.H. Germination of witchweed (*Striga lutea Lour.*): Isolation and properties of a potent stimulant. *Science* **1966**, *154*, 1189–1190. [CrossRef]
- 107. López-Ráez, J.A.; Charnikhova, T.; Fernández, I.; Bouwmeester, H.; Pozo, M.J. Arbuscular mycorrhizal symbiosis decreases strigolactone production in tomato. *J. Plant Physiol.* **2011**, *168*, 294–297. [CrossRef]
- Stanga, J.P.; Smith, S.M.; Briggs, W.R.; Nelson, D.C. SUPPRESSOR OF MORE AXILLARY GROWTH2 1 (SMAX2) controls seed germination and seedling development in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.* 2013, 163, 318–330. [CrossRef]
- 109. Lefebvre, V.; North, H.; Frey, A.; Sotta, B.; Seo, M.; Okamoto, M.; Nambara, E.; Marion-Poll, A. Functional analysis of Arabidopsis NCED6 and NCED9 genes indicates that ABA synthesized in the endosperm is involved in the induction of seed dormancy. *Plant J.* 2006, 45, 309–319. [CrossRef]
- Martínez-Andújar, C.; Ordiz, M.I.; Huang, Z.; Nonogaki, M.; Beachy, R.N.; Nonogaki, H. Induction of 9-cis-epoxycarotenoid dioxygenase in *Arabidopsis thaliana* seeds enhances seed dormancy. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2011, 108, 17225–17229. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 111. Saez, A.; Apostolova, N.; Gonzalez-Guzman, M.; Gonzalez-Garcia, M.P.; Nicolas, C.; Lorenzo, O.; Rodriguez, P.L. Gain-of-function and loss-of-function phenotypes of the protein phosphatase 2C HAB1 reveal its role as a negative regulator of abscisic acid signalling. *Plant J.* 2004, *37*, 354–369. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 112. Mehrotra, R.; Bhalothia, P.; Bansal, P.; Basantani, M.K.; Bharti, V.; Mehrotra, S. Abscisic acid and abiotic stress tolerance–Different tiers of regulation. *J. Plant Physiol.* **2014**, 171, 486–496. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Sah, S.K.; Reddy, K.R.; Li, J. Abscisic acid and abiotic stress tolerance in crop plants. *Front. Plant Sci.* 2016, 7, 571. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 114. Karssen, C.; Hilhorst, H.; Koornneef, M. The benefit of biosynthesis and response mutants to the study of the role of abscisic acid in plants. In *Plant Growth Substances 1988;* Springer: Berlin, Germany, 1990; pp. 23–31.
- 115. Bentsink, L.; Koornneef, M. Seed dormancy and germination. Arab. Book 2008, 6, 119. [CrossRef]
- 116. Jones, H.D.; Kurup, S.; Peters, N.C.; Holdsworth, M.J. Identification and analysis of proteins that interact with the *Avena fatua* homologue of the maize transcription factor VIVIPAROUS1. *Plant J.* 2000, 21, 133–142. [CrossRef]
- 117. Nambara, E.; Naito, S.; McCourt, P. A mutant of Arabidopsis which is defective in seed development and storage protein accumulation is a new abi3 allele. *Plant J.* **1992**, *2*, 435–441. [CrossRef]
- 118. Ng, D.W.; Chandrasekharan, M.B.; Hall, T.C. The 5' UTR negatively regulates quantitative and spatial expression from the ABI3 promoter. *Plant Mol. Biol.* **2004**, *54*, 25–38. [CrossRef]
- 119. Beaudoin, N.; Serizet, C.; Gosti, F.; Giraudat, J. Interactions between abscisic acid and ethylene signaling cascades. *Plant Cell* **2000**, *12*, 1103–1115. [CrossRef]
- 120. Chiwocha, S.D.; Cutler, A.J.; Abrams, S.R.; Ambrose, S.J.; Yang, J.; Ross, A.R.; Kermode, A.R. The etr1-2 mutation in *Arabidopsis thaliana* affects the abscisic acid, auxin, cytokinin and gibberellin metabolic pathways during maintenance of seed dormancy, moist-chilling and germination. *Plant J.* **2005**, *42*, 35–48. [CrossRef]
- Cadman, C.S.; Toorop, P.E.; Hilhorst, H.W.; Finch-Savage, W.E. Gene expression profiles of Arabidopsis Cvi seeds during dormancy cycling indicate a common underlying dormancy control mechanism. *Plant J.* 2006, 46, 805–822. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 122. Millar, A.A.; Jacobsen, J.V.; Ross, J.J.; Helliwell, C.A.; Poole, A.T.; Scofield, G.; Reid, J.B.; Gubler, F. Seed dormancy and ABA metabolism in Arabidopsis and barley: The role of ABA 8'-hydroxylase. *Plant J.* 2006, 45, 942–954. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 123. Xiong, L.; Gong, Z.; Rock, C.D.; Subramanian, S.; Guo, Y.; Xu, W.; Galbraith, D.; Zhu, J.-K. Modulation of abscisic acid signal transduction and biosynthesis by an Sm-like protein in Arabidopsis. *Dev. Cell* 2001, 1, 771–781. [CrossRef]

- 124. Parcy, F.; Valon, C.; Kohara, A.; Miséra, S.; Giraudat, J. The ABSCISIC ACID-INSENSITIVE3, FUSCA3, and LEAFY COTYLEDON1 loci act in concert to control multiple aspects of Arabidopsis seed development. *Plant Cell* **1997**, *9*, 1265–1277.
- 125. Parcy, F.; Valon, C.; Raynal, M.; Gaubier-Comella, P.; Delseny, M.; Giraudat, J. Regulation of gene expression programs during Arabidopsis seed development: Roles of the ABI3 locus and of endogenous abscisic acid. *Plant Cell* **1994**, *6*, 1567–1582.
- 126. Ding, Z.J.; Yan, J.Y.; Li, G.X.; Wu, Z.C.; Zhang, S.Q.; Zheng, S.J. WRKY41 controls Arabidopsis seed dormancy via direct regulation of ABI3 transcript levels not downstream of ABA. *Plant J.* **2014**, *79*, 810–823. [CrossRef]
- 127. Barrero, J.M.; Millar, A.A.; Griffiths, J.; Czechowski, T.; Scheible, W.R.; Udvardi, M.; Reid, J.B.; Ross, J.J.; Jacobsen, J.V.; Gubler, F. Gene expression profiling identifies two regulatory genes controlling dormancy and ABA sensitivity in Arabidopsis seeds. *Plant J.* 2010, *61*, 611–622. [CrossRef]
- 128. Vaistij, F.E.; Gan, Y.; Penfield, S.; Gilday, A.D.; Dave, A.; He, Z.; Josse, E.-M.; Choi, G.; Halliday, K.J.; Graham, I.A. Differential control of seed primary dormancy in Arabidopsis ecotypes by the transcription factor SPATULA. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2013, 110, 10866–10871. [CrossRef]
- 129. Yamagishi, K.; Tatematsu, K.; Yano, R.; Preston, J.; Kitamura, S.; Takahashi, H.; McCourt, P.; Kamiya, Y.; Nambara, E. CHOTTO1, a double AP2 domain protein of *Arabidopsis thaliana*, regulates germination and seedling growth under excess supply of glucose and nitrate. *Plant Cell Physiol.* 2008, *50*, 330–340. [CrossRef]
- 130. Yano, R.; Kanno, Y.; Jikumaru, Y.; Nakabayashi, K.; Kamiya, Y.; Nambara, E. CHOTTO1, a putative double APETALA2 repeat transcription factor, is involved in abscisic acid-mediated repression of gibberellin biosynthesis during seed germination in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.* 2009, 151, 641–654. [CrossRef]
- Skubacz, A.; Daszkowska-Golec, A.; Szarejko, I. The role and regulation of ABI5 (ABA-Insensitive 5) in plant development, abiotic stress responses and phytohormone crosstalk. *Front. Plant Sci.* 2016, 7, 1884. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Griffiths, J.; Kohji, M.; Rieu, I.; Zentella, R.; Zhang, Z.-L.; Powers, S.J.; Gong, F.; Phillips, A.L.; Hedden, P.; Sun, T.-P.; et al. Genetic characterization and functional analysis of the GID1 gibberellin receptors in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell* 2007, *18*, 3399–3414. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Ueguchi-Tanaka, M.; Nakajima, M.; Katoh, E.; Ohmiya, H.; Asano, K.; Saji, S. Molecular interactions of a soluble gibberellin receptor, GID1, with a rice DELLA protein, SLR1, and gibberellin. *Plant Cell* 2007, 19, 2140–2155. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 134. Dill, A.; Thomas, S.G.; Hu, J.; Steber, C.M.; Sun, T.-P. The Arabidopsis F-box protein SLEEPY1 targets gibberellin signaling repressors for gibberellin-induced degradation. *Plant Cell* 2004, 16, 1392–1405. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 135. Fu, X.; Richards, D.E.; Fleck, B.; Xie, D.; Burton, N.; Harberd, N.P. The Arabidopsis mutant sleepy1gar2-1 protein promotes plant growth by increasing the affinity of the SCFSLY1 E3 ubiquitin ligase for DELLA protein substrates. *Plant Cell* **2004**, *16*, 1406–1418. [CrossRef]
- 136. McGinnis, K.M.; Thomas, S.G.; Soule, J.D.; Strader, L.C.; Zale, J.M.; Sun, T.-P.; Steber, C.M. The Arabidopsis SLEEPY1 gene encodes a putative F-box subunit of an SCF E3 ubiquitin ligase. *Plant Cell* 2003, 15, 1120–1130. [CrossRef]
- 137. Sasaki, A.; Itoh, H.; Gomi, K.; Ueguchi-Tanaka, M.; Ishiyama, K.; Kobayashi, M.; Jeong, D.-H.; An, G.; Kitano, H.; Ashikari, M. Accumulation of phosphorylated repressor for gibberellin signaling in an F-box mutant. *Science* 2003, 299, 1896–1898. [CrossRef]
- Magome, H.; Yamaguchi, S.; Hanada, A.; Kamiya, Y.; Oda, K. The DDF1 transcriptional activator upregulates expression of a gibberellin-deactivating gene, GA20x7, under high-salinity stress in Arabidopsis. *Plant J.* 2008, *56*, 613–626. [CrossRef]
- Yaish, M.W.; El-kereamy, A.; Zhu, T.; Beatty, P.H.; Good, A.G.; Bi, Y.-M. The APETALA-2-like transcription factor OsAP2-39 controls key interactions between abscisic acid and gibberellin in rice. *PLoS Genet.* 2010, 6, 1001098. [CrossRef]
- 140. Narsai, R.; Law, S.R.; Carrie, C.; Xu, L.; Whelan, J.; Law, S.R.; Carrie, C.; Xu, L.; Whelan, J. In-depth temporal transcriptome profiling reveals a crucial developmental switch with roles for RNA processing and organelle metabolism that are essential for germination in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.* 2011, 157, 1342–1362. [CrossRef]
- 141. Wilson, R.L.; Kim, H.; Bakshi, A.; Binder, B.M. The ethylene receptors ETHYLENE RESPONSE1 and ETHYLENE RESPONSE2 have contrasting roles in seed germination of Arabidopsis during salt stress. *Plant Physiol.* 2014, 165, 1353–1366. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- 142. Xi, W.; Liu, C.; Hou, X.; Yu, H. MOTHER OF FT AND TFL1 regulates seed germination through a negative feedback loop modulating ABA signaling in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell* **2010**, *22*, 1733–1748. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 143. Xi, W.; Yu, H. MOTHER OF FT AND TFL1 regulates seed germination and fertility relevant to the brassinosteroid signaling pathway. *Plant Signal. Behav.* **2010**, *5*, 1315–1317. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 144. Dave, A.; Vaistij, F.E.; Gilday, A.D.; Penfield, S.D.; Graham, I.A. Regulation of *Arabidopsis thaliana* seed dormancy and germination by 12-oxo-phytodienoic acid. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2016**, *67*, 2277–2284. [CrossRef]
- 145. Finch-Savage, W.E.; Cadman, C.S.; Toorop, P.E.; Lynn, J.R.; Hilhorst, W.H. Seed dormancy release in Arabidopsis Cvi by dry after-ripening, low temperature, nitrate and light shows common quantitative patterns of gene expression directed by environmentally specific sensing. *Plant J.* **2007**, *51*, 60–78. [CrossRef]
- 146. Simpson, G.M. Seed Dormancy in Grasses; Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK, 2007; pp. 197–206.
- 147. Footitt, S.; Douterelo-Soler, I.; Clay, H.; Finch-Savage, W.E. Dormancy cycling in Arabidopsis seeds is controlled by seasonally distinct hormone-signaling pathways. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2011, 108, 20236–20241. [CrossRef]
- 148. Buriro, M.; Oad, F.C.; Keerio, M.I.; Tunio, S.; Gandahi, A.W.; Hassan, S.W.U.; Oad, S.M. Wheat seed germination under the influence of temperature regimes. *Sarhad J. Agric.* **2011**, *27*, 539–543.
- 149. Nyachiro, J.; Clarke, F.; DePauw, R.; Knox, R.; Armstrong, K. Temperature effects on seed germination and expression of seed dormancy in wheat. *Euphytica* **2002**, *126*, 123–127. [CrossRef]
- 150. Reddy, L.; Metzger, R.; Ching, T. Effect of Temperature on Seed Dormancy of Wheat. *Crop Sci.* **1985**, 25, 455–458. [CrossRef]
- 151. Lim, S.; Park, J.; Lee, N.; Jeong, J.; Toh, S.; Watanabe, A.; Kim, J.; Kang, H.; Kim, D.H.; Kawakami, N. ABA-INSENSITIVE3, ABA-INSENSITIVE5, and DELLAs interact to activate the expression of SOMNUS and other high-temperature-inducible genes in imbibed seeds in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell* 2013, 25, 4863–4878. [CrossRef]
- 152. Contreras, S.; Bennett, M.A.; Metzger, J.D.; Tay, D. Maternal light environment during seed development affects lettuce seed weight, germinability, and storability. *HortScience* **2008**, *43*, 845–852. [CrossRef]
- 153. Barrero, J.M.; Downie, A.B.; Xu, Q.; Gubler, F. A role for barley CRYPTOCHROME1 in light regulation of grain dormancy and germination. *Plant Cell* **2014**, *26*, 1094–1104. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 154. Gubler, F.; Hughes, T.; Waterhouse, P.; Jacobsen, J. Regulation of dormancy in barley by blue light and after-ripening: Effects on abscisic acid and gibberellin metabolism. *Plant Physiol.* **2008**, *147*, 886–896. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 155. Ochuodho, J.O.; Modi, A.T. Light-induced transient dormancy in *Cleome gynandra* L. seeds. *Afr. J. Agric. Res.* **2007**, *2*, 587–591.
- 156. Derkx, M.; Karssen, C. Effects of light and temperature on seed dormancy and gibberellin-stimulated germination in *Arabidopsis thaliana*: Studies with gibberellin-deficient and-insensitive mutants. *Physiol. Plant* 1993, *89*, 360–368. [CrossRef]
- 157. Debeaujon, I.; Lepiniec, L.; Pourcel, L.; Routaboul, J.-M. Seed coat development and dormancy. *Annu. Plant Rev.* **2007**, *27*, 25–49.
- 158. Groos, C.; Gay, G.; Perretant, M.-R.; Gervais, L.; Bernard, M.; Dedryver, F.; Charmet, G. Study of the relationship between pre-harvest sprouting and grain color by quantitative trait loci analysis in a white× red grain bread-wheat cross. *Theor. Appl. Genet.* **2002**, *104*, 39–47. [CrossRef]
- 159. Sweeney, M.T.; Thomson, M.J.; Pfeil, B.E.; McCouch, S. Caught red-handed: Rc encodes a basic helix-loop-helix protein conditioning red pericarp in rice. *Plant Cell* **2006**, *18*, 283–294. [CrossRef]
- 160. Adebo, H.O.; Ahoton, L.E.; Quenum, F.; Ezin, V. Agro-morphological characterization of *Corchorus olitorius* cultivars of Benin. *Annu. Res. Rev. Biol.* **2015**, *7*, 229–240. [CrossRef]
- 161. Stetter, M.G.; Vidal-Villarejo, M.; Schmid, K.J. Convergent seed color adaptation during repeated domestication of an ancient new world grain. *BioRxiv* 2019. BioRxiv:547943.
- 162. Akubugwo, I.; Obasi, A.; Ginika, S. Nutritional potential of the leaves and seeds of black nightshade-*Solanum nigrum* L. Var *virginicum* from Afikpo-Nigeria. *Pak. J. Nutr.* 2007, *6*, 323–326. [CrossRef]
- 163. Paśko, P.; Sajewicz, M.; Gorinstein, S.; Zachwieja, Z. Analysis of selected phenolic acids and flavonoids in *Amaranthus cruentus* and *Chenopodium quinoa* seeds and sprouts by HPLC. *Acta Chromatogr.* 2008, 20, 661–672. [CrossRef]
- Yang, R.-Y.; Lin, S.; Kuo, G. Content and distribution of flavonoids among 91 edible plant species. *Asia Pac. J. Clin. Nutr.* 2008, 17, 275–279. [PubMed]

- 165. Foley, M.E.; Fennimore, S.A. Genetic basis for seed dormancy. Seed Sci. Res. 1998, 8, 173–182. [CrossRef]
- 166. Nguyen, T.-P.; Keizer, P.; van Eeuwijk, F.; Smeekens, S.; Bentsink, L. Natural variation for seed longevity and seed dormancy are negatively correlated in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Plant Physiol.* **2012**, *160*, 2083–2092. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 167. Huang, X.; Schmitt, J.; Dorn, L.; Griffith, C.; Effgen, S.; Takao, S.; Koornneef, M.; Donohue, K.J.M.E. The earliest stages of adaptation in an experimental plant population: Strong selection on QTLS for seed dormancy. *Mol. Ecol.* 2010, *19*, 1335–1351. [CrossRef]
- 168. Clerkx, E.J.; El-Lithy, M.E.; Vierling, E.; Ruys, G.J.; Blankestijn-De Vries, H.; Groot, S.P.; Vreugdenhil, D.; Koornneef, M. Analysis of natural allelic variation of Arabidopsis seed germination and seed longevity traits between the accessions Landsberg erecta and Shakdara, using a new recombinant inbred line population. *Plant Physiol.* 2004, 135, 432–443. [CrossRef]
- 169. Keurentjes, J.J.; Willems, G.; van Eeuwijk, F.; Nordborg, M.; Koornneef, M. A comparison of population types used for QTL mapping in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Plant Genet. Resour.* **2011**, *9*, 185–188. [CrossRef]
- 170. Alonso-Blanco, C.; Peeters, A.J.; Koornneef, M.; Lister, C.; Dean, C.; van den Bosch, N.; Pot, J.; Kuiper, M.T. Development of an AFLP based linkage map of Ler, Col and Cvi *Arabidopsis thaliana* ecotypes and construction of a Ler/Cvi recombinant inbred line population. *Plant J.* **1998**, *14*, 259–271. [CrossRef]
- 171. Qin, X.; Zeevaart, J.A. Overexpression of a 9-cis-epoxycarotenoid dioxygenase gene in *Nicotiana plumbaginifolia* increases abscisic acid and phaseic acid levels and enhances drought tolerance. *Plant Physiol.* 2002, 128, 544–551. [CrossRef]
- 172. Thompson, A.J.; Jackson, A.C.; Symonds, R.C.; Mulholland, B.J.; Dadswell, A.R.; Blake, P.S.; Burbidge, A.; Taylor, I.B. Ectopic expression of a tomato 9-cis-epoxycarotenoid dioxygenase gene causes over-production of abscisic acid. *Plant J.* **2000**, *23*, 363–374. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 173. Xu, Y. Molecular Plant Breeding; CAB International: Oxfordshire, UK, 2010; pp. 195–247.
- 174. Kearsey, M.; Farquhar, A. QTL analysis in plants; where are we now? *Heredity* **1998**, *80*, 137. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 175. Bove, J.; Jullien, M.; Grappin, P. Functional genomics in the study of seed germination. *Genome Biol.* **2001**, *3*, 1002.1. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 176. Holdsworth, M.J.; Finch-Savage, W.E.; Grappin, P.; Job, D. Post-genomics dissection of seed dormancy and germination. *Trends Plant Sci.* 2008, *13*, 7–13. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 177. Chibani, K.; Ali-Rachedi, S.; Job, C.; Job, D.; Jullien, M.; Grappin, P. Proteomic analysis of seed dormancy in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.* **2006**, *142*, 1493–1510. [CrossRef]
- 178. Li, F.; Wu, X.; Tsang, E.; Cutler, A.J. Transcriptional profiling of imbibed *Brassica napus* seed. *Genomics* 2005, *86*, 718–730. [CrossRef]
- Fait, A.; Angelovici, R.; Less, H.; Ohad, I.; Urbanczyk-Wochniak, E.; Fernie, A.R.; Galili, G. Arabidopsis seed development and germination is associated with temporally distinct metabolic switches. *Plant Physiol.* 2006, 142, 839–854. [CrossRef]
- Gao, F.; Ayele, B.T. Functional genomics of seed dormancy in wheat: Advances and prospects. *Front. Plant Sci.* 2014, 5, 458. [CrossRef]
- Harada, J.J.; Pelletier, J. Genome-wide analyses of gene activity during seed development. *Seed Sci. Res.* 2012, 22, S15–S22. [CrossRef]
- 182. Schranz, M.E.; Song, B.-H.; Windsor, A.J.; Mitchell-Olds, T. Comparative genomics in the Brassicaceae: A family-wide perspective. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* **2007**, *10*, 168–175. [CrossRef]
- Ayenan, M.A.T.; Sodedji, K.A.F.; Nwankwo, C.I.; Olodo, K.F.; Alladassi, M.E.B. Harnessing genetic resources and progress in plant genomics for fonio (*Digitaria* spp.) improvement. *Genet. Resour. Crop Evol.* 2018, 65, 373–386. [CrossRef]
- 184. Ajaiyeoba, E. Phytochemical and antimicrobial studies of *Gynandropsis gynandra* and *Buchholzia coriaceae* extracts. *Afr. J. Biomed. Res.* **2000**, *3*, 161–165.
- 185. Barker, M.S.; Vogel, H.; Schranz, M.E. Paleopolyploidy in the Brassicales: Analyses of the Cleome transcriptome elucidate the history of genome duplications in Arabidopsis and other Brassicales. *Genome Biol. Evol.* 2009, 1, 391–399. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 186. Marshall, D.M.; Muhaidat, R.; Brown, N.J.; Liu, Z.; Stanley, S.; Griffiths, H.; Sage, R.F.; Hibberd, J.M. Cleome, a genus closely related to Arabidopsis, contains species spanning a developmental progression from C3 to C4 photosynthesis. *Plant J.* 2007, *51*, 886–896. [CrossRef]

- 187. Van den Bergh, E.; Külahoglu, C.; Bräutigam, A.; Hibberd, J.M.; Weber, A.P.; Zhu, X.-G.; Schranz, M.E. Gene and genome duplications and the origin of C4 photosynthesis: Birth of a trait in the Cleomaceae. *Curr. Plant Biol.* **2014**, *1*, 2–9. [CrossRef]
- 188. Amtmann, A. Learning from evolution: Thellungiella generates new knowledge on essential and critical components of abiotic stress tolerance in plants. *Mol. Plant* **2009**, *2*, 3–12. [CrossRef]
- 189. Mobility for Breeders in Africa. Available online: https://mobreed.com (accessed on 15 October 2019).
- 190. Sorrells, M.E.; La Rota, M.; Bermudez-Kandianis, C.E.; Greene, R.A.; Kantety, R.; Munkvold, J.D.; Mahmoud, A.; Ma, X.; Gustafson, P.J.; Qi, L.L. Comparative DNA sequence analysis of wheat and rice genomes. *Genome Res.* **2003**, *13*, 1818–1827.
- 191. Zhu, H.; Choi, H.-K.; Cook, D.R.; Shoemaker, R.C. Bridging model and crop legumes through comparative genomics. *Plant Physiol.* 2005, *137*, 1189–1196. [CrossRef]
- 192. Nadeem, M.A.; Nawaz, M.A.; Shahid, M.Q.; Doğan, Y.; Comertpay, G.; Yıldız, M.; Hatipoğlu, R.; Ahmad, F.; Alsaleh, A.; Labhane, N. DNA molecular markers in plant breeding: Current status and recent advancements in genomic selection and genome editing. *Biotechnol. Biotechnol. Equip.* **2018**, *32*, 261–285. [CrossRef]
- 193. Van den Bergh, E. Comparative Genomics and Trait Evolution in Cleomaceae, a Model Family for Ancient Polyploidy. Ph.D. Thesis, Wageningen University, Wageningen, The Netherlands, 2017.
- 194. Mutwil, M.; Klie, S.; Tohge, T.; Giorgi, F.M.; Wilkins, O.; Campbell, M.M.; Fernie, A.R.; Usadel, B.; Nikoloski, Z.; Persson, S. PlaNet: Combined sequence and expression comparisons across plant networks derived from seven species. *Plant Cell* 2011, 23, 895–910. [CrossRef]
- 195. Das, G.; Rao, G.J.; Varier, M.; Prakash, A.; Prasad, D. Improved Tapaswini having four BB resistance genes pyramided with six genes/QTLs, resistance/tolerance to biotic and abiotic stresses in rice. *Sci. Rep.* 2018, *8*, 2413. [CrossRef] [PubMed]



© 2020 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).